A Thesis Presented to

The Faculty of Alfred University

Enlightenment and Sure Remedy: The Development of Ethics, Thought, and Activism of the 19<sup>th</sup> Century Temperance Movement in the Western New York

by

Jonathan Makeley

In Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements for Honors in History

## April 2017

Thesis Introduction	- 2
Context and Key Trends	- 2
Alcohol Issues Entering into the Period	- 3
Religious Dynamics	- 4
Reformism and Free Society	- 7
Medicine as it Relates to Alcohol and Temperance	10
Economics and Prosperity	· 13
Education and Communication	16
Women in Temperance	18
Youth in Temperance	21
The Beginning Formation of Temperance Thinking and Activism	24
The Temperance Pledge	26
Temperance Organizations	· 30
The Emergence and Shift Toward Teetotalism	33
The Prohibitionist Shift	35
The Maine Law and the First Prohibitionist Wave in the 1850's	38
The Development of Temperance and Prohibitionism in the Later 19th Century	41
Understanding the Mental and Ethical Dynamics at Work in the Major Shifts in the Region's Temperance Movement	- 43
Conclusion	44
Bibliography	46

# Table of Contents

In the course of the 19<sup>th</sup> century, American Society saw significant transformation among people's thinking, which manifested into and was perpetuated by a variety of reform movements, and produced a multitude of significant changes in the conditions of people and society. Moreover, this period saw the rise intellectual, ethical, and social attitudes favorable for encouraging efforts of activism and reform, impressive in its quality and magnitude. Few Areas in this country are as iconic and comprehensive for this reformism as is the area of Western New York. And in this period of reform, Temperance was one of the most significant movements. The temperance movement involved a significant transformation in ideas about the nature of alcohol and its problems, the intellectual, ethical, and effective significance of these matters, and of the individual and collective responsibilities which people had in addressing it. These matters would end up spawning a widespread movement working to combat the problems of alcohol, which evolved to produce a force which sought to eliminate the use of alcohol and establish the legal prohibition of the alcohol industry.

This paper focuses on the history of the temperance movement in 19<sup>th</sup> century Western New York. It draws upon research into primary and secondary writings to gain an understanding of the social and intellectual factors involved in the development of temperance thought in activity. This thesis aims to demonstrate how significant shifts in intellectual and ethical thinking where connected to the development of the temperance movement onto the course of teetotalism and prohibitionism.

#### **Context and Key Trends**

For the purposes of this paper, Western New York can be regarded as the area roughly comprising modern day Allegany, Cattaraugus, Steuben, Chautauqua, Erie, Wyoming. Livingston, Niagara, Orleans, Ontario, Monroe, Wayne, Seneca, Schuler, Yates, and Chemung Counties.

Western New York formed in the period following the United States of America gaining independence, and was largely established on land acquired from treaties with the Iroquois.<sup>1</sup> The area was settled and developed throughout the 19<sup>th</sup> century. Major migrant groups in the region

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Harry S. Douglas, "PIONEER EXPERIENCES IN WESTERN NEW YORK" *New York History* Vol. 32, No. 3 (July, 1951), pp. 259-274, JSTOR, Accessed April 25, 2016 <u>http://www.jstor.org/stable/23149916</u>, 259-264

included settlers from New England and Pennsylvania, as well as German and Irish immigrants.<sup>2</sup> The Erie Canal and subsequent infrastructure projects helped to interconnect the region, enable communication, and aid in the development of cities, such as Buffalo and Rochester.<sup>3</sup> Western New York in this period was part of area of intense religious revivalism in the Second Great Awakening, known as the Burned Over District. Western New York also became a significant host for a variety of reform activity, including abolitionism, women's rights, and temperance.<sup>4</sup>

## **Alcohol Issues Entering into the Period**

The temperance movement in Western New York arose in the context of alcohol issues in American society. Now people holding anti-alcohol views or wanting to engage in collective efforts against it were not something new. Presumably there have been people with temperance views since humans began producing alcoholic beverages. In colonial and revolutionary America there were scattered efforts by courts and public institutions to discourage drunkenness and 'strong drink' (high proof distilled alcohol). Though these did little in terms of attracting support or effecting the conditions of drinking.<sup>5</sup>

Early American society had an alcohol-heavy culture. The consumption of alcohol seems to have been commonly accepted and practiced among most of the population. A wide variety of different alcoholic beverages were produced and consumed across the country. Alcohol was a common feature for most social functions, and taverns functioned as centers for social gathering and travel.<sup>6</sup>

The use of alcohol proliferated during the post-revolutionary period. It is estimated that the average annual consumption of alcohol per person in 1792 was a 2 ½ gallons. In 1810, it rose

Rochester New York, 1815-1837, (New York: Hill and Wang, 2004), 14-21

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Whitney Cross, *The Burned Over District: The social and Intellectual History of Enthusiastic Religion in Western New York, 1800-1850,* (Ithaca: Cornell University press, 1950), 1-29; Douglas, "PIONEER EXPERIENCES IN WESTERN NEW YORK", 259-264; O. Turner, *History of the Pioneer Settlement of the Phelps and Gorham Purchase and Morris Reserve.* 1851, (Reprint, Geneseo: James Brunner, 1976), 153-292; O. Turner, *Pioneer History of the Holland Land Purchase of Western New York*, (Buffalo: Jewitt, Thomas and Co., Geo. H. Derby and Co., 1849), 445-606 <sup>3</sup> Cross, *The Burned Over District*, 55-77; Paul E. Johnson, *A Shopkeeper's Millennium; Society and Revivals in* 

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Cross, The Burned Over District, 16-35; 103-136; 193-255; 318-355

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup>Alice Felt Tyler, *Freedom's Ferment – Phases of American Social History to 1860,* (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1944), 308-314

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Tyler, *Freedom's Ferment*, 308-312; Ronald G. Walters, *American Reformers 1815-1860*, (New York: Hill and Wang, 1984), 124-125

to 4 ½ gallons, and by 1823, the rate tripled to 7 ½ gallons.<sup>7</sup> This increase in alcohol use was accompanied with an increase in various alcohol induced problems. The rise in alcohol use and problems contributed to people's changing beliefs about the nature and effects of alcohol. It also encouraged people to engage in activities to limit alcohol in the effort to combat social ills.<sup>8</sup> The increase in alcohol use thus constituted one of the reasons why temperance movements arose in 19<sup>th</sup> century Western New York.

#### **Religious Dynamics**

The temperance movement in Western New York was also affected by the religious dynamics in the area. From roughly 1790 to 1850, the United States experienced a series of (mainly Protestant) religious revivals and reforms, known as the Second Great Awakening. Western New York was part of an area of significant religious revival in this period known as the Burned Over District.<sup>9</sup> The revivalism in the Burned Over District led to the rise of various religious ideas and movements, including, Christian Perfectionism, Ultraism, Millenarianism, and religious communalism.<sup>10</sup> The diverse range of effects produced by various religious movements in the region influenced elements of the population toward efforts at reforming conditions in the world. This helped encourage some people to become involved with emerging reform movements, including abolitionism, temperance, and women's rights.<sup>11</sup>

Certain strains of religious thinking developed in the Burned Over District helped to foster temperance thinking among portions of the public. There was a tendency for more people place greater emphasis on the religious importance of actions in life, an increased belief in the ability to reform man, an increase emphasis on the individual as a figure of spiritual and moral agency.<sup>12</sup> Ultraism tended to promote a belief in the ability of individuals to directly connect with and understand divinity, as well as the importance of being directed according to the logic of absolute principles.<sup>13</sup> Christian Perfectionism promoted the idea that people could be absolved

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Tyler, *Freedom's Ferment*, 308-312

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> Tyler, *Freedom's Ferment*, 308-312; Joel Wakeman, *The Mysterious Parchment: Or, The Satanic License, Dedicated to Maine Law Progress*, (Boston: John P. Jewett and Company, 1853), https://babel.hathitrust.org/cgi/pt?id=hvd.32044088987623;view=1up;seq=11, 3-5

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> Cross, *The Burned Over District,* vii-51; Tyler, *Freedom's Ferment,* 68-80

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> Cross, *The Burned Over District*, 187-321; Tyler, *Freedom's Ferment*, 68-85

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> Cross, *The Burned Over District*, 16-35; 76-148; 193-251; 274-281; 318-353; Tyler, *Freedom's Ferment*, 308-338;

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> Cross, The Burned Over District, 1-53; 173-286

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> Cross, *The Burned Over District*, 173-210

of sin and attain spiritual perfection in their lifetime.<sup>14</sup> Millennialism and Post-Millennialism encouraged people to engage in efforts to help 'save souls' and prepare for the coming creation of 'the kingdom of God on earth'.<sup>15</sup> These stains of thinking became conducive toward temperance when they were combined with a growing concern over the effects of alcohol, as well as a growing belief among some religious thinkers that alcohol use could be spiritually corrosive.<sup>16</sup>

The influence of these sorts of ideas can be seen in varying degrees and aspects among elements of the temperance movement. For instance, the temperance speeches of Buffalo mayor George W. Clinton and doctor Austin Flint, displayed ultraist notions, and portrayed the temperance movement as part of holy endeavor. In an 1845 address George Clinton stated, "We are advocates of Temperance- friends of total abstinence from all that intoxicates. The advancement of the holy movement of our age against alcohol in all forms".<sup>17</sup> In Austin Flint's 1841 address to the Buffalo Young Men's Temperance Society he stated,

"What reasonable, conscientious man will deliberately deny the fundamental positions assumed by the most ultra of the temperance reformers! Does Anyone need arguments in addition to his own observations, and the deductions of *common sense*, to convince him that intemperance is a curse to the individual, to society, and to the state? ... But this is a subject which appeals not alone to the perceptions and discriminations of the intellect. It embraces that higher principle which is the manifestation of the deity in the human conscious. It calls for the exercise of that great moral element, the *will*"<sup>18</sup>

In these addresses, Clinton and Flint demonstrates ways in which religious thinking acted to frame temperance thinking for certain individuals. The religious ideas and motivations of

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> Cross, *The Burned Over District,* 238-256; 334-351; Tyler, *Freedom's Ferment,* 68-85; Walters, *American Reformers* 1815-1860, 18-58

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> Cross, *The Burned Over District*, 79; 146-196; 200-224; 232-253; 278-329

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> Cross, *The Burned Over District*, 103-136; 211-217; Tyler, *Freedom's Ferment*, 308-330

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> George W. Clinton, Address Delivered By George W. Clinton At the Dedication of Erie Tent No. 30, I.O. of R. Of The City Of Buffalo, Friday, October 24, 1845, Buffalo: Press of C.E. Young, 1845, HV5295.C541845C.2, 'Breweries, Temperance & Prohibition in Buffalo, NY' collection, Buffalo and Erie County Historical Society Library, 4-6

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> Austin Flint M.D., *An Address To the Buffalo Young Men's Temperance Society, Thursday Evening April 1, 1841, By Austin Flint M. D., To Which Are Added The Constitution Of The Society, and A List Of The Members,* (Buffalo: Press of Thomas and Co, 1841), HV 5298.B83F41841, 'Breweries, Temperance & Prohibition in Buffalo, NY' collection, Buffalo and Erie County Historical Society Library, 4-5

temperance activists differed between various people, though the influence of religious revivalism did affect a significant portion of temperance figures in some manner.

Religious influences were also present among the social dynamic of temperance. Some religious figures were involved in the promotion of temperance. For instance, temperance writer Joel Wakeman, was a minister, who for a time headed the Presbyterian Church in the town of Almond.<sup>19</sup> In Corning, Father Peter Colgan, who was head of St Mary's Roman Catholic Parish for most of 1860-1896, established a parish temperance society in 1861.<sup>20</sup> Some temperance groups were fostered by religious denominations, and some temperance groups, such as the Women's Christian temperance Union, were openly religious in orientation.<sup>21</sup>

Though, at same time, it is importance to remember the difference and variation which was at work. While some temperance activists and groups were religiously inspired, others were secular, and quite often people were a mixture of both. The level of support for temperance also varied with time, location, between and among denominations, and among individuals.<sup>22</sup> A Presbyterian in Rochester did not necessarily have the same views as Methodist or Episcopalian, or even another member of his denomination.<sup>23</sup> Some groups, such as the Irish and German Catholics, tended to not be as drawn to temperance for cultural and theological reasons. Though, there were catholic temperance advocates, such as Peter Colgan.<sup>24</sup> The general attitude of

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup> Helene C. Phelan, *And Why Not Every Man*, (Interlaken: Heart of the Lakes Publishing1987), 54; 197; Helene C. Phelan, "Bibliography", *IF Our Earthly Dissolve; A Story of the Wetherby- Hagadorn Family of Almond New York, Told From Their Diaries and Papers*, (Alfred: Sun Publishing Company, 1973)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>20</sup> Robert F. McNamara, *A Century of Grace: The History of St. Mary's Roman Catholic Parish Corning*, N.Y. 1848-1948, Second Edition, (Corning: St. Mary's Church, 1979), 39-52; 106; Uri Mulford, *Pioneer Days and Later Times in Corning and the Vicinity*, (Corning, New York: Uri Mulford, N. d.),

https://archive.org/stream/cu31924028823783#page/n3/mode/2up, 209

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup> Johnson, A Shopkeeper's Millennium, 75-94; Carol Mattingly, Well Tempered Women; Nineteenth Century Temperance Rhetoric, (Carbondale: Southern Illinois University Press, 1998), 39-74; Cross, The Burned Over District, 130-137; Louise B. Willard, "Eighty One Women Started W.C.T.U. Here Sixty-Three Years Ago", The Livingston Republican, Cent Ed. P9. 19, Sept 23, 1937; Declaration of Principles, Written by Frances E. Willard, n.d. Livingston County Historian's office, Mt. Morris, New York

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>22</sup>Johnson, A Shopkeeper's Millennium, 55-61; 75-94; 121-133; Cross, The Burned Over District, 76-83; 130-137; Susan Rumsey Strong, "The Most Natural Way in the World; Coeducation at Nineteenth Century Alfred University", Ph.D. Thesis, Margaret Warner Graduate School of Education and Human Development, University of Rochester, Rochester, New York, 1995, 460-463; Eva St. Clair Champlin and Frances Babcock, An Offering to the Memory of Abigail Allen, by the Literary Societies of Alfred University, (Alfred, New York: Sun Publishing Association, 1903), 44-59

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>23</sup> Johnson, A Shopkeeper's Millennium, 55-61; 75-94; 121-133; Cross, The Burned Over District, 76-83; 130-137
 <sup>24</sup> McNamara, A Century of Grace, 39-52; 106; Cross, The Burned Over District, 83-84; Johnson, A Shopkeeper's Millennium, 75-80; 94-99; 126-130

religious congregations also changed over the century. For instance, in the early 1800's alcohol was commonly used and socially accepted among the Seventh Day Baptist congregation in Alfred New York. By the late 1820's some members began to reject the use of liquor, and within a decade there were temperance advocates giving lectures and promoting temperance pledges. In 1836, the Seventh Day Baptist General Conference passed a resolution promoting total abstinence from "ardent spirits, wines, and fermented liquors".<sup>25</sup> It is important to keep in mind that while there where general changes in temperance thinking and activity in the area throughout the century, that these developments occurred in complex and somewhat heterogenous manner.

## **Reformism and Free Society**

The temperance movement in Western New York was part of a broader field of reform thinking and activism which was occurring in the area. 19<sup>th</sup> Century Western New York was a significant center for major reform movements, such as abolitionism and the early women's rights movement. It had been host to figures such as Frederick Douglas, Susan B. Anthony, and Asahel Cole.<sup>26</sup> It was host to the Seneca Falls Convention in 1848, and a center for developing anti-slavery politics and the Republican Party.<sup>27</sup> More broadly, it was host to a variety of people contemplating issues of the conditions of people and society in a variety of fields, establishing a multitude of new ideas and understandings, and at differing levels acting to seek to enact changes.<sup>28</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>25</sup> Strong, The Most Natural Way in the World, 460-463; "Minutes of the Seventh-Day Baptist General Conference, Held at Alfred N.Y. September, 1836", *Seventh Day Baptist Year Books 1808-1844*, Alfred: Alfred College Library, 10-11; Alfred Historical Society and Baker's Bridge Association, *History of Alfred, New York*. (Dallas, Texas: Curtis Media Corporation, 1990), 47; John S. Minard, *Allegany County and its People; A Centennial Memorial History of Allegany County New York*, (Alfred New York: University Press, Sun Publishing Association, 1896), http://babel.hathitrust.org/cgi/pt?id=loc.ark:/13960/t55d8zx2j;view=1up;seq=853, 633-647

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>26</sup> Cross, *The Burned Over District*, vii-x; 16-35;105; 191-353; Mattingly, *Well Tempered Women*, 4-53; 100-104; Asahel N. Cole, *Cole's Combined System of Drainage and Irrigation; "A New System of Agriculture"*, Ed. A.P Cole, (Wellsville: 1889), <u>http://babel.hathitrust.org/cgi/pt?id=pst.000005415595;view=1up;seq=12</u>, 1-66; Phelan, *And Why Not Every Man*, 37-59; Frederick Douglas Papers, Underground Railroad Collection, Allegany County Historian's Office, Belmont, New York

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>27</sup> Elizabeth Cady Stanton, Susan B. Anthony; Correspondence, Writings, Speeches, Edited with a critical commentary by Ellen Carol DuBois, Forward by Gerda Lerner, (New York: Shocken Books, 1981), 2-35; 54; 192-209; Judah B. Ginsberg, "Barnburners, Free Soilers, and the New York Republican Party". New York History 57 (4) (1976), New York State Historical Association, <u>http://www.jstor.org/stable/23169428</u>, 475-500

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>28</sup> Cross, *The Burned Over District*, vii-x; 16-35;105-169; 191-353

Temperance thinking was part of and took influence from the intellectual strains of the reformist environment. As mentioned, there was a growing strain of thought which held an increasing belief in the ability for people to improve themselves and their society, and increasing emphasis on the moral importance to endeavor to do so.<sup>29</sup> Furthermore, a combination of factors, including the rise of the American Republic, the Second Great Awakening, and the Transcendentalist Movement, gave rise to a various ideas and debates about the nature of individuality, responsibility, social obligation, and the nature of freedom and liberty.<sup>30</sup>

There were temperance supporters who embraced the notion that the vitality of the individual was linked to his physical, spiritual, moral, and/or intellectual condition. This notion combined with the belief that alcohol damaged those capacities, could lead to the conclusion that alcohol was destructive to the personal sanctity and wellbeing of an individual.<sup>31</sup> There were those who regarded looking after one's own wellbeing and/or aiding the wellbeing of others was part of one's essential responsibilities. There were those who regarded the realization of one's essential nature in life, including well constituted moral and mental condition as a necessary aspect of being a free man and being able to exercise. In connection with this, the effects of alcohol and the attachment to it, could be regard as something which was destructive to internal liberty.<sup>32</sup> Indeed, some regarded it as something akin to slavery.<sup>33</sup> This strain of thinking could thus led to the belief that the elimination of alcohol was important to creating a condition in which people were fully realized as individuals, could live according to their responsibilities, and be free.<sup>34</sup> These ideas were adopted in some form or degree by various temperance supporters in Western New York.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>29</sup> Cross, The Burned Over District, vii-51; 103-351; Tyler, Freedom's Ferment, 68-85; 308-350; Walters, American Reformers 1815-1860, 18-58

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>30</sup> Tyler, Freedom's Ferment, 5-85; 308-389; Walters, American Reformers 1815-1860, 3-76

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>31</sup> James R. Irish, Manuscript of Speech delivered by James R. Irish on Jan 1, 1838, before the Alfred Total-Abstinence Society, Alfred, 1838, Alfred University Archives, Herrick Library, 1-56; Clinton, Address Delivered By George W. Clinton At the Dedication of Erie Tent No. 30, I.O. of R. Of The City Of Buffalo, Friday, October 24, 1845, 1-8; 16; Flint, An Address To the Buffalo Young Men's Temperance Society, 1-7

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>32</sup> Irish, Manuscript of Speech delivered by James R. Irish on Jan 1, 1838, before the Alfred Total-Abstinence Society, 1-56; Clinton, Address Delivered By George W. Clinton At the Dedication of Erie Tent No. 30, I.O. of R. Of The City Of Buffalo, Friday, October 24, 1845, 1-8; Flint, An Address To the Buffalo Young Men's Temperance Society, 1-7; 11; Wakeman, The Mysterious Parchment, 194-235

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>33</sup> The Common People: From Lincoln's Address at Springfield, Illinois, February 22, 1842, New York City: W.C.T.U., Livingston County Historian's office, Mt. Morris, New York

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>34</sup> Irish, Manuscript of Speech delivered by James R. Irish on Jan 1, 1838, before the Alfred Total-Abstinence Society, 1-56; Clinton, *Address Delivered By George W. Clinton At the Dedication of Erie Tent No. 30, I.O. of R. Of* 

These considerations also framed aspects of the disputes between the supporters and opponents of temperance. To those who embraced the aforementioned notions, drinking practices could be regarded as degrading toward man. While those at the time who did not believe alcohol to be harmful could regard temperance negatively.<sup>35</sup> For instance, in an account of the life of Jonathan Allen states,

"He became a total abstainer at the age of thirteen... he was laughed at and jeered at by his companions, and was the recipient of many persecutions. This only made him stronger in his convictions. He never changed in his percepts; as he came into contact with young men who became victims of the drink curse, he learned to pity the victim and hate the traffic."<sup>36</sup>

There were also people who held to a different notion of liberty, which believed liberty consisted of an individual to do as they wished, and which regarded capricious desires to be part of the will, rather than an obstacle to it. These sorts of people could come to regard temperance and prohibitionism as a threat to their 'freedom'.<sup>37</sup> Furthermore, there were certain strains of religious and philosophical though which believed that the ability of individuals to live according to their conscience was vital for faith and freedom. These types of thinkers could at times be friendly to voluntary abstinence efforts, but unfriendly to efforts at legal prohibition.<sup>38</sup>

The temperance movement was also linked to other reform movements at the time. Numerous individuals embraced multiple social movements. For instance, Jonathan and Abigail Allen of Alfred were involved with temperance, anti-slavery, women's rights and suffrage, and efforts to expand educational opportunities for women and racial minorities.<sup>39</sup> Some temperance

The City Of Buffalo, Friday, October 24, 1845, 1-8; 16; Flint, An Address To the Buffalo Young Men's Temperance Society, 1-7; 11; Tyler, Freedom's Ferment, 5-85; 308-389; Walters, American Reformers 1815-1860, 3-76; 123-144; Wakeman, The Mysterious Parchment, 194-235

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>35</sup> Walters, American Reformers 1815-1860, 123-144; Johnson, A Shopkeeper's Millennium, 55-61; Abigale Allen, Life and Sermons of Jonathan Allen, Ph.D., D.D., LL.D., President of Alfred University, (Alfred: Published By Subscription, 1894), 174

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>36</sup> Abigail Allen, *Life and Sermons of Jonathan Allen*, 174

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>37</sup> Johnson, A Shopkeeper's Millennium, 55-61; Walters, American Reformers 1815-1860, 123-144

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>38</sup> Tyler, *Freedom's Ferment*, 327-338; William Jay Haskett, *A letter to the friends of temperance in the state of New York; Against Prohibition and for a license law based on pecuniary policy*, (New York: J.D. Torrey, 1858), https://babel.hathitrust.org/cgi/pt?id=uc2.ark:/13960/t6vx08r72;view=1up;seq=3, 3-7

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>39</sup> John Nelson Norwood, *Fiat Lux; The Story of Alfred University,* (Alfred, New York: Alfred University, 1957), 1-67; Abigail Allen, *Life and Sermons of Jonathan Allen,* 40-47; 90-157; 173-200; Strong, The Most Natural Way in the World, 460-463; Susan Rumsey Strong, *Thought Know No Sex; Women's Rights at Alfred University,* (Albany: State University of New York Press, 2008), 35-113; Minard, *Allegany County and its People,* 633-647; St. Clair Champlin and Babcock, *An Offering to the Memory of Abigail Allen,* 23-37; 49-56

activists in Rochester were also involved with the Sabbatarian and/or the anti-masonic movements.<sup>40</sup> Female temperance figures such as Susan Anthony, Elizabeth Cady Stanton, and Amelia Bloomer were early advocates of women's rights and suffrage.<sup>41</sup> Temperance writer Joel Wakeman was abolitionist, and commanded a company of Union soldiers in the Civil War.<sup>42</sup> Asahel Cole was an anti-slavery politician and newspaper producer, with ties to Frederick Douglas and Horace Greeley.<sup>43</sup> In an 1875 book on the history of Chautauqua County, its biographical accounts included 14 people individually described as supporters of temperance. Of them, it describes six as involved in religious activism, four as involved with benevolent societies, and two as involved with the anti-slavery cause.<sup>44</sup> These connections helped to shape the significance of the temperance movement for its supporters and produce connections within reformist activism, which produced opportunities for the mutual growth for these movements. The temperance, abolitionist, women's rights, and other such movements, became for some, an interconnected effort for changing the conditions of man and society.

#### Medicine as it Relates to Alcohol and Temperance

The development of the temperance movement was influenced by an evolving medical field. In the post-revolutionary period, American medicine grew toward holding a more professional based structure and expanded its use of scientific and explanatory medical research. Part of this evolution included doctors who turned their attention toward investigating the effects of alcohol.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>40</sup> Johnson, A Shopkeeper's Millennium, 62-133

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>41</sup>"Woman's New York State Temperance Society", Alcohol Problems and Solutions.org, Accessed October 5, 2016, <u>http://www.alcoholproblemsandsolutions.org/womans-new-york-state-temperance-society/</u>; D.C. Bloomer, *Life and Writings of Amelia Bloomer; With A New Introduction by Susan J. Kleinberg*, 1895, (Reprint, New York: Shocken Books, 1975), 84-86; *Elizabeth Cady Stanton, Susan B. Anthony; Correspondence, Writings, Speeches*, 17-57
<sup>42</sup> Phelan, *And Why Not Every Man*, 54; 197; Phelan, "Bibliography" *IF Our Earthly Dissolve* 

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>43</sup> Cole, *Cole's Combined System of Drainage and Irrigation*, 1-28; Frederick Douglas Papers, Underground Railroad Collection, Allegany County Historian's Office, Belmont, New York

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>44</sup> This information is meant is demonstrate some of the causes which temperance supporters also took up. It should not be taken as something definitive of the percentage of temperance supporters involved with certain causes; given that this particular book only focuses on one county, does not cover the whole century, it covers those the author deemed to be notable and not the whole population, its accounts have varying degrees of detail, and some activities, such as anti-slavery activities could be kept secret by the practitioners.

Andrew Young, *History of Chautauqua County New York; From its First Settlement to the Present Time*, (Buffalo: Mathews and Warren, 1875), <u>https://archive.org/stream/cu31924078391814/cu31924078391814\_djvu.txt</u>, 196; 301-302; 352-361; 421-422; 448; 464; 543-552; 596; 609-641-642

In 1784, Philadelphia physician and founding father, Dr. Benjamin Rush published *An Inquiry into the Effects of Spirituous Liquors on the Human Body and Mind.*<sup>45</sup> This was followed by a series of other publications, such as *An Inquiry into the Effects of Ardent Spirits on the Human Mind and Body*, in 1815.<sup>46</sup> Rush's writings recorded the observed effects of heavy distilled alcohol use on the body and mind; including various forms of physical illness, death, the impairment of mental and moral faculties, and contribution toward poverty and criminal behavior. They dispelled some of the popularly believed benefits of distilled spirits, such as helping with cold or hot weather. It recommended that distilled liquors be substituted with water, coffee, tea, molasses, and non-distilled forms of alcohol. They also recommended the development of practices that would counter motivations to use distilled spirits; such as supplying more food to laborers.<sup>47</sup> In doing so, these writings both an early use of medical opinion against alcohol, and the tendency among some early temperance thinkers to turn their focus on initially decrying distilled alcohol.

The work of Dr. Rush helped to fuel the early temperance movement. Rush's books became widely distributed in his time and contributed to changing the views of some in the public. A variety of temperance groups promoted, distributed, and reprinted his writings as part of their efforts.<sup>48</sup> By 1850, the American Tract Society had produced over 172,000 copies of *An Inquiry into the Effects of Ardent Spirits on the Human Mind and Body*. Rush and other American physicians, (such as Jeremy Belknap of New England and David Ramsey of South Carolina), also worked to promote temperance through writing, public speaking, and appealing to influential figures and groups.<sup>49</sup>

The influence of medicine on temperance also found local expression within Western New York. This can be instantiated by Hiram Burdick. Burdick was a minister, dentist, and physician from Alfred New York. He was also a temperance activist. He had given his first temperance lecture in 1837, at the age of 18, and continued to advocate for it throughout his

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>45</sup> Walters, American Reformers 1815-1860, 125

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>46</sup> Tyler, *Freedom's Ferment*, 314-316; Walters, *American Reformers* 1815-1860, 125

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>47</sup> Benjamin Rush, An Inquiry into the Effects of Ardent Spirits on the Human Mind and Body, 8th ed. (Boston: James Loring, 1823), <u>https://babel.hathitrust.org/cgi/pt?id=hvd.hn8np3;view=1up;seq=6</u>; Tyler, *Freedom's Ferment*, 314-316; Walters, *American Reformers 1815-1860*, 125

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>48</sup> Tyler, *Freedom's Ferment*, 314

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>49</sup> Tyler, Freedom's Ferment, 314-316; Walters, American Reformers 1815-1860, 125

life.<sup>50</sup> His obituary in the Alfred Sun states, "He was ardent worker for the temperance cause", and that his stance against alcohol was so firm that he "was more than once the subject of legal contest with the supporters of the traffic as the endeavored to silence him".<sup>51</sup>

A significant portion of his medical career was involved as a practitioner and promoter of the water cure.<sup>52</sup> The water cure was a form of medicine, popular in the 19<sup>th</sup> century, which was centered around the use of pure water to prevent and treat illness. This approach regarded the use of alcohol, narcotics, and stimulants as toxic substances, which should be removed from consumption.<sup>53</sup> Burdick spent part of his career practicing water cure treatments in New York City and Buffalo, and established a water cure sanitarium in Alfred.<sup>54</sup> His belief that the health of the body effected the mental and spiritual health of the person connected and mutually reinforced his medical and reformist ideas.<sup>55</sup>

The medical aspects of alcohol acted as an element of many local temperance discourses throughout the period. Organizations, such as the New York Temperance Society, included medical information in their temperance publications.<sup>56</sup> Temperance speakers, such as Buffalo mayor George W. Clinton, made mention of the physical harms of alcohol.<sup>57</sup> In 1874, R.H. McDonald & Co. Druggists and General Agents distributed its Vinegar Bitters Almanac in Livingston County. The Almanac was centered on promoting a vinegar based medicine; casting

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>50</sup> "Rev. Hiram Burdick; This Pioneer Physician and Clergyman Died at His Home on Hartsville Hill", Alfred Sun, April 6, 1904, Alfred University Archives; *Alfred Yearbook 1903-1904*, (Alfred, New York: Alfred University, 1904), 113-114

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>51</sup> "Rev. Hiram Burdick; This Pioneer Physician and Clergyman Died at His Home on Hartsville Hill"

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>52</sup> "Rev. Hiram Burdick; This Pioneer Physician and Clergyman Died at His Home on Hartsville Hill"; *Alfred Yearbook* 1903-1904, 113-114

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>53</sup> Joel Shew, Hydropathy; or, The water cure: its principles, modes of treatment, (New York: Wiley & Putnam, 1844), <u>https://babel.hathitrust.org/cgi/pt?id=hvd.hn1v37;view=1up;seq=19</u>, ix-31

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>54</sup> "Rev. Hiram Burdick; This Pioneer Physician and Clergyman Died at His Home on Hartsville Hill", Alfred Sun, April 6, 1904, Alfred University Archives; *Alfred Yearbook 1903-1904*, (Alfred, New York: Alfred University, 1904), 113-

<sup>114;</sup> Helene C. Phelan, *Allegany's Uncommon Folk*, (Alfred: Sun Publishing Company, 1978), 84-102

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>55</sup> "Rev. Hiram Burdick; This Pioneer Physician and Clergyman Died at His Home on Hartsville Hill", Alfred Sun, April 6, 1904, Alfred University Archives; Phelan, *Allegany's Uncommon Folk*, 84-102

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>56</sup> New-York State Temperance Society. *American quarterly temperance magazine*. *Vol. 1-2.* (Albany: Executive committee of the N.Y.S. temperance society, 1833-34),

https://babel.hathitrust.org/cgi/pt?id=umn.31951001891524s;view=1up;seq=4, 1-23; 51-82; 136-182; 230-258; Second Annual Report of the New York State Society for the Promotion of Temperance. Presented by the State Committee January 18<sup>th</sup> 1831. Albany: Packard and Van Benthuysen, 1831.

https://babel.hathitrust.org/cgi/pt?id=umn.31951d001531673;view=1up;seq=5, 4-77;

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>57</sup> George W. Clinton Esq., Address of George W. Clinton Delivered Before The Young Men's Temperance Society of Buffalo, March, 6<sup>th</sup>, 1841, (Buffalo: Frenchett and Scheffer, 1841), HV5295.C541841c.2. 'Breweries, Temperance & Prohibition in Buffalo, NY' collection, Buffalo and Erie County Historical Society Library, 2-6

itself as a pro-temperance product and including medical declarations about the harms of alcohol.<sup>58</sup> The Buffalo Medical Journal included publications of doctors commenting on issues over how public society should treat alcohol problems. Shortly after the end of the century, it carried an article by F.E. Fronczak, contending that chronic alcoholics should be diverted from prison into medical treatment facilities.<sup>59</sup> Overall, concerns over the effect of alcohol on the body and mind, informed by medical notions, helped to influence temperance thinking and discourse in the area.

### **Economics and Prosperity**

The thinking of people toward alcohol and temperance was in part influenced by concerns over the effects of alcohol on personal and social economic concerns. There were people who grew increasingly concerned that drunkenness could damage the ability of a man to earn a living and that the attachment to alcohol would cause men to squander their money on buying drinks. When men lost their productivity, and wasted their money on alcohol it deprived not only themselves, but also the wives and children of such men. This could in turn lead to poor living conditions, economic losses, and poverty.<sup>60</sup> In early 1800's various charitable and humanitarian organizations in the country came to regard drunkenness as a significant cause of poverty. In 1817, a New York City Ad Hoc citizens committee on poverty concluded that alcoholism was a prominent cause of pauperism and rising expenses for anti-poverty efforts.<sup>61</sup>

Temperance advocates incorporated these considerations into their appeals. For instance, Rev. Joel Wakeman's books *The Mysterious Parchment; Or, the Satanic License* and *The Golden Horn; Or, The Fatal Exchange*, included stories of the social and economic effects of

<sup>59</sup> F.E. Fronczak, *Alcoholism- A Crime or a Disease,* (Buffalo: Buffalo Medical Society, February 1901), In 'Breweries, Temperance & Prohibition in Buffalo, NY' collection, Buffalo and Erie County Historical Society Library

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>58</sup> Vinegar Bitters 1874 Almanac, (San Francisco: R.H. McDonald and Co., Druggists and General Agents, 1874), Livingston County Historian's Office, Mt. Morris, New York, 1-33

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>60</sup> Clinton, Address of George W. Clinton Delivered Before The Young Men's Temperance Society of Buffalo, March, 6<sup>th</sup>, 1841, 3-4 ;Joel Wakeman, *The Golden Horn, or the Fatal Exchange,* (Lewisburg: S.T. Buck Son and Co., 1882), 1-457; Wakeman, *The Mysterious Parchment,* 13-75; 103-142; 197-246; 309-340; James Dormer, *Mr. Dormer's Address: Economic Aspects Of The Liquor Traffic,* HV742.N7D47, Rare Collection, 'Breweries, Temperance & Prohibition in Buffalo, NY' collection, Buffalo and Erie County Historical Society Library, 1-15; Tyler, *Freedom's Ferment,* 316-318

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>61</sup> Raymond A. Mohl, *Poverty in New York, 1783-1825,* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1971), 116-133; 211-225

alcohol.<sup>62</sup> This included characters who drove their families into poverty, children going hungry due to their father's drinking, a man whose drinking cost him his business, and people losing possessions and homes as a cost from drinking.<sup>63</sup> In *The Golden Horn*, there is a character whose drinking nearly ruined his family. He quits drinking, reforms himself, and devotes himself to fixing their situation. Years later his family's situation has improved, they are economically sound, and he looks back on his past regretting his mistakes.<sup>64</sup> Wakeman's books also portray the distributors of alcohol as people who, whether by ignorance or greed, profit from having and encourage people to become attached to alcohol. In his stories, those with economic ties to alcohol presented major obstacles efforts to combat intemperance.<sup>65</sup> Thus, his writings presented alcohol as both economically damaging to users, yet perpetuated by the economic interests of distributors.

There were also temperance activists who took interest on the broader social costs from drunkenness. In his March 1841 speech to the Buffalo Young Men's Temperance Society, George Clinton, took aim the social costs intemperance. In addition to the poverty it caused, there was the social cost of the crime and other social ills it produced. Furthermore, the money that was used to pay for alcohol could have been put to more beneficial uses such as irrigating land, helping the poor, or beautifying Buffalo area.<sup>66</sup> James Dormer, in an 1883 address to the Charity Organization Society in Buffalo, contended that the liquor traffic was a burden on tax payers by increasing the costs of dealing with poverty, widows and orphans, and desolate

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>62</sup> These books consisted of pro-temperance stories, set in fictional towns, which gave stories about the harms of alcohol on people, the greed of alcohol distributors, the efforts of people to reform themselves, and the efforts of people to promote temperance and local prohibition. Wakeman states that he based his stories of his own experiences viewing the effects of drinking on people, and that the harms that befell his characters were things that befell actual people.

Wakeman was a fairly prominent writer, whose works were well distributed. *The Mysterious Parchment, Or The Satanic License* had several prints and was distributed across much of the United States and parts of Western Europe.

Joel Wakeman, The Mysterious Parchment, 3-5; Phelan, "Bibliography" IF Our Earthly Dissolve; Wakeman, The Golden Horn, 1-457

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>63</sup>Wakeman, *The Mysterious Parchment*, 13-75; 103-142; 197-246; 309-340; Wakeman, *The Golden Horn*, 77-276; 380-431

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>64</sup> Wakeman, *The Golden Horn*, 139-149; 251-286; 331-343

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>65</sup>Wakeman, *The Mysterious Parchment,* 13-75; 99-180; 197-246; 286-340; Wakeman, *The Golden Horn,* 11-45; 77-88; 139-286; 344-419

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>66</sup> Clinton, Address of George W. Clinton Delivered Before The Young Men's Temperance Society of Buffalo, March, 6<sup>th</sup>, 1841, 3-4

properties. He likewise condemns saloons operators, the liquor industry and the grain industry, on the charge that they ignore the human costs that come from their products.<sup>67</sup>

These arguments represent a part of the intellectual shifts which helped build the temperance movement. As more people came to consider the long term and consequential effects which alcohol consumption and drunkenness had on people, in expanded on the ways which people could regard alcohol as harmful. Consideration of the consequences of how intemperance effected other people and produced social costs helped provide a rationale for considering alcohol use to be common issue.

The economic conditions in Western New York also effected the development of the temperance movement. In 1825, the Erie Canal was completed. the Canal helped foster the development of trade and industry in Western New York, and contributed to rise of Buffalo and Rochester as cities.<sup>68</sup> Throughout the 19<sup>th</sup> century, the region saw the development of infrastructure, railroads, agricultural innovation, and the developments of the industrial revolution. This produced an expansion of businesses with employed labor forces.<sup>69</sup> An increasing number of businessman came to believe that drinking reduced the productivity of their workforce. This led manufacturers to stop the practice of providing drinks to their workers and to institute bans on drinking while at work. Some businessman were motivated to support temperance efforts, in order to help produce a more sober and productive workforce.<sup>70</sup>

In *A Shopkeeper's Millennium*, Paul Johnson describes the Rochester business class's shift in attitude toward drinking. In the 1820's, Rochester merchants and middle class households came increasingly to view liquor as unfit for business and domestic life. Efforts to expand the productivity in workshops replaced the old norm of drinking at work, with a standard of sobriety on the job.<sup>71</sup> Temperance activists aligned with many of the socially prominent members of the city to encourage temperance among the working class. Early efforts started with encouraging temperance by example, and the 1830's had expanded to include efforts to restrict

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>67</sup> Dormer, Mr. Dormer's Address: Economic Aspects Of The Liquor Traffic, 1-15

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>68</sup> Cross, *The Burned Over District*, 55-77

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>69</sup> Cross, *The Burned Over District,* 55-112; Johnson, A Shopkeeper's Millennium, 15-61; Cole, Cole's Combined System of Drainage and Irrigation, 1-66

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>70</sup> Johnson, A Shopkeeper's Millennium, 55-61; Mulford, Pioneer Days and Later Times in Corning and the Vicinity, 190

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>71</sup> Johnson, A Shopkeeper's Millennium, 55-61

the number of stores selling liquor.<sup>72</sup> Some in the Rochester working class were turned off from temperance at the time due to issues of employer-employee relations and a mental association of drinking with working class sociability.<sup>73</sup> Though this was not the only instance in which other issues influenced people's views in favor or against temperance. In this same period, the posturing of differing political factions, the Anti-Masonic movement, and contentions between religious leaders in Rochester influenced citizens in favor and against temperance.<sup>74</sup> Though this example is specific to a certain city in the 1820's and 30's, it helps to demonstrate that economic interests had some influences on the attitudes of people toward temperance.

## **Education and Communication**

The distribution of information on alcohol related issues played an important role in being able to successfully promote temperance. The use of lectures and informational meetings were important tools for local temperance advocates and groups to gain converts.<sup>75</sup> In Alfred, the efforts undertaken by Dr. John Collins and his associates in the local temperance society from 1830-1844 resulted in over 500 signed total abstinence pledges.<sup>76</sup> Various local activists and groups established temperance newspapers. For instance, a man named Lloyd Mills, published a temperance paper called *The Tocsin*, in Maryville in 1845.<sup>77</sup> One of the more notable newspapers was *The Lily*; established by Seneca Falls Lady's Temperance Society, and edited by Amelia Bloomer, from 1849-1953.<sup>78</sup> In addition, organizations such as the New York State Temperance Society, produced their own temperance publications and almanacs.<sup>79</sup> These spoken and written

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>72</sup> Johnson, A Shopkeeper's Millennium, 55-61; 75-94; 113-133

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>73</sup> Johnson, A Shopkeeper's Millennium, 55-61

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>74</sup> Johnson, A Shopkeeper's Millennium, 75-133

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>75</sup> Minard, *Allegany County and its People*, 11-30; 199-230; 351-402; 460-468; 633-647; 717-740; 824-898; Collection of Women's Christian Temperance Union of Livingston County Meeting Programs, 1887-1903, Livingston County Historian's office, Mt. Morris, New York; Willard, "Eighty One Women Started W.C.T.U. Here Sixty-Three Years Ago"; Strong, The Most Natural Way in the World, 460-463; Cross, *The Burned Over District*, 93-109; *The Cuba Temperance Assembly August 13 To 19, 1895 Programme*, The Cuba Temperance Society, In The Temperance and Cuba Meeting Grounds Collection, Cuba Historical Society, Cuba, New York

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>76</sup> Minard, Allegany County and its People, 641

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>77</sup> Young, History of Chautauqua County New York, 196

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>78</sup> "The Lily: A Temperance and Abolitionist Newspaper", Accessible Archives Inc, Accessed March 18, 2017, <u>http://www.accessible-archives.com/collections/the-lily/</u>; D.C. Bloomer, *Life and Writings of Amelia Bloomer*, 38-54;82-133

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>79</sup> New-York State Temperance Society, *American quarterly temperance magazine*. *Vol.* 1-2; New York State Temperance Society, *The Temperance Almanac No.* 8, *For the Year of Our Lord* 1841, (Utica: G.R. Perkins, 1841), <u>https://babel.hathitrust.org/cgi/pt?id=hvd.32044105551097;view=1up;seq=2</u>; New York State Temperance Society, *The Temperance Almanac For the Year of Our Lord* 1845, (Troy: Executive Committee of the New York

efforts by advocates and organizations worked to build support for temperance ideas and bring people into the movement.

Some temperance activists worked to spread their ideas through educational institutions. Some established their own institutions, such the Cuba Temperance Camp meeting grounds.<sup>80</sup> Others worked with local and Sabbath schools.<sup>81</sup> There were temperance activists who sought to create public education programs on the effects of alcohol. By 1896, they succeeded in getting the New York State Legislature to pass a law which required and set standards for public schools to provide information on the effects of alcohol in health education, and medical programs in state colleges to include education on the effects of alcohol and alcohol related illnesses.<sup>82</sup>

There were also temperance supporters within institutions of higher education. For example, Alfred University and its precursor institutions had a significant pro-temperance element within them. Dr. H. P. Burdick is reported to have stated that, "The school from the first became an active and efficient worker. It teachers were pronounced radicals, not in temperance only, but in all the great reformatory movements of the age... leading up the steps of progress".<sup>83</sup> James R. Irish, head of Alfred Academy (precursor to Alfred University), was an early supporter of temperance.<sup>84</sup> In an 1838 speech to the Alfred Total Abstinence Society, he stated; "What is the engine of death by which Intemperance, the king of all vices has made such total inroads? We answer, Alcohol; clad in whatever disguise it may be, it is Alcohol."<sup>85</sup> Alfred University's second President, Jonathan Allen was an advocate for total-abstinence and for prohibition.<sup>86</sup> His wife and university professor, Abigail Allen, was an advocate for temperance and women's

State Temperance Society, B.H. Boynton, 1845),

https://babel.hathitrust.org/cgi/pt?id=umn.31951002261725y;view=1up;seq=3

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>80</sup> Minard, Allegany County and its People, 11; 200-231; 468; 723-745; 802-842; The Cuba Temperance Assembly August 13 To 19, 1895 Programme; The Cuba Temperance Assembly August 13 To 19, 1895 Programme, The Cuba Temperance Society, In The Temperance and Cuba Meeting Grounds Collection, Cuba Historical Society, Cuba, New York; Twentieth Annual Session: Cuba Temperance Society, Cuba: Cuba Temperance Society, 1881, Temperance and Cuba Meeting Grounds Collection. Cuba Historical Society

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>81</sup> "Rev. Hiram Burdick; This Pioneer Physician and Clergyman Died at His Home on Hartsville Hill"; Phelan, *Allegany's Uncommon Folk*, 87-102; Mattingly, *Well Tempered Women*, 51-71; Minard, *Allegany County and its People*, 641; Tyler, *Freedom's Ferment*, 325

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>82</sup> The Ainsworth School Physiology Law, With Amendments of 1896, Livingston County Historian's office, Mt. Morris, New York

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>83</sup> Abigail Allen, *Life and Sermons of Jonathan Allen,* 41

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>84</sup> Susan Rumsey Strong, *Thought Know No Sex*, 36-51

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>85</sup> Irish, Manuscript of Speech delivered by James R. Irish on Jan 1, 1838, before the Alfred Total-Abstinence Society, Alfred, 15

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>86</sup> Abigale Allen, *Life and Sermons of Jonathan Allen*, 41; Strong, The Most Natural Way in the World, 463-465

rights, who was involved with the WCTU for many years.<sup>87</sup> Temperance supporters within Alfred University joined with temperance activists in the town of Alfred to ban the sale of liquor in town. Through lectures and discussion events, members of the university discussed and promoted a variety of reform movements, including temperance, abolitionism, and women's rights.<sup>88</sup> While, Alfred University is pointed example, and the level of support for temperance varied between educational institutions, it is still the case that the presence of temperance supporters within educational institutions had some influence in advancing temperance ideas.

## Women in Temperance

The temperance issue could hold an additional significance for women involved with it. In the 19<sup>th</sup> century United States, women were in various ways limited in their legal and social power. This included the tendency for to mainly hold official control over the property and finances of a household, varying restrictions on the ability of women to hold property, social limitations on education and work opportunities, and higher difficulty in seeking divorce. Women married to drunken, fiscally irresponsible, and/or abusive husbands could be left to suffer as a result.<sup>89</sup> These sorts of problems helped to fuel women's interest in temperance.<sup>90</sup> In the early 19<sup>th</sup> century, the notion of women being involved in public discussion and public issues was generally treated as abnormal and to some degree taboo.<sup>91</sup> The rise of middle class culture included in it a tendency assign a feminine domestic sphere.<sup>92</sup> Since the issue of alcohol transcended the public-domestic distinction, it both encouraged women to be involved with

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>87</sup> St. Clair Champlin and Babcock, *An Offering to the Memory of Abigail Allen,* 44-59; Strong, *Thought Know No Sex,* 51-113

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>88</sup> Minard, Allegany County and its People, 633-647; Abigale Allen, Life and Sermons of Jonathan Allen, 40-47; 90-151; 173-200; Strong, The Most Natural Way in the World, 460-465; Alfred Historical Society and Baker's Bridge Association, History of Alfred, New York, 47-48; Norwood, Fiat Lux, 1-67

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>89</sup> Mattingly, Well Tempered Women, xiii-38

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>90</sup> Mattingly, *Well Tempered Women*, xiii-38; "Temperance Worker", National Susan B. Anthony Museum and House Website, Accessed October 05, 2016, <u>http://susanbanthonyhouse.org/her-story/temp-worker.php</u>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>91</sup>Gerda Lerner, *The Grimké Sisters from South Carolina : Pioneers for Women's Rights and Abolition* (2), (Chapel Hill, US: The University of North Carolina Press, 2009. Accessed December 26, 2016), ProQuest ebrary, <u>http://site.ebrary.com/lib/herr/detail.action?docID=10355400</u>, 1-10; 66-79; 116-152; 166-178; Lori D. Ginzberg, *Women and the work of benevolence: Morality, politics, and class in the nineteenth-century united states*, (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1990), 60-81

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>92</sup> Johnson, A Shopkeeper's Millennium, 55-61; Mattingly, Well Tempered Women, xiii-38; Ginzberg, Women and the work of benevolence, 1-35

temperance in the name of domestic interests, and created an avenue for women to seek to become involved with public issues.<sup>93</sup>

Female temperance activists played an important part in promoting temperance within Western New York. Evidence indicates that both men and women were involved with local temperance activities from the beginning.<sup>94</sup> In Alfred, one of the earliest objectors to liquor included Mrs. Maxson Stillman, who refused to raise her house with whiskey.<sup>95</sup> In *A Shopkeeper's Millennium*, Paul Johnson credits the wives of merchants as playing a significant role in promoting sobriety among the merchant class of Rochester.<sup>96</sup> Women continued to make up a large and important part of temperance activism throughout the century. For instance, in 1853, the Women's State Temperance Society collected 28,000 signatures for a petition to the state legislature, calling on them to pass a law limiting the sale of liquor.<sup>97</sup>

In the course of the 19<sup>th</sup> century, there was a growth of women-based temperance organization. While women were involved in temperance activity, certain prominent organizations, such as the New York State Temperance Society, marginalized female temperance supporters. Some groups, barred women from membership.<sup>98</sup> Other groups, such as the Sons of Temperance set up separate female branches of their organization.<sup>99</sup> By the 1840's, Women in various areas began to organize their own temperance societies. In 1852, a group of 500 women, including Susan B. Anthony, Elizbeth Cady Stanton, and Amelia Bloomer, met in Rochester to form the Woman's New York State Temperance Society.<sup>100</sup> In 1873, Frances Willard founded

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>93</sup> Ginzberg, Women and the work of benevolence, 1-35; 60-81; Mattingly, Well Tempered Women, xiii-74

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>94</sup> Mattingly, *Well Tempered Women*, xiii-38; Strong, The Most Natural Way in the World, 461; Johnson, *A Shopkeeper's Millennium*, 55-61

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>95</sup> Strong, The Most Natural Way in the World, 461

Raising referred to the practice of members of a community working together to help construct a building, which was common in many American rural communities in the 18<sup>th</sup> and 19<sup>th</sup> centuries. Furthermore, it was common practice at the time for the recipients of the building to provide food and drinks to the workers; with Whiskey being the common house raising drink in the area. By not providing whiskey, Mrs. Stillman challenged and started to break apart one of the traditional spaces of social drinking.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>96</sup> Johnson, A Shopkeeper's Millennium, 55-61

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>97</sup> Martin Marion Clark, Martin Marion Clark to Eslie Langworthy, Letter, June 7, 1870. V-File: Alfred Area History: letters. Alfred University Archives, Herrick Library; Mattingly, *Well Tempered Women*, xiii-74; 'Woman's New York State Temperance Society"

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>98</sup> "Woman's New York State Temperance Society"; Mattingly, *Well Tempered Women*, xiii-38; *Elizabeth Cady Stanton, Susan B. Anthony; Correspondence, Writings, Speeches*,17-57

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>99</sup> Mattingly, *Well Tempered Women*, xiii-38; "Woman's New York State Temperance Society"

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>100</sup> "Woman's New York State Temperance Society"; D.C. Bloomer, *Life and Writings of Amelia Bloomer*, 84-86; *Elizabeth Cady Stanton, Susan B. Anthony; Correspondence, Writings, Speeches*, 17-57

the Women's Christian Temperance Union in Hillsboro, Ohio. The WTCU grew to become a national organization.<sup>101</sup> Local chapters were established in many counties and towns in Western New York during the 1870's and 1880's.<sup>102</sup> The Prohibition Party was founded in 1869, as a political party centered on establishing legal prohibition across the nation. The party admitted women as full members and supported women's suffrage.<sup>103</sup> These organizations helped to establish temperance as the prominent social force in the late 19<sup>th</sup> and early 20<sup>th</sup> century.<sup>104</sup>

The temperance movement also helped to foster the development of the women's rights movement. The temperance movement helped to normalize the notion of women speaking in public and to build a social space where women could seek to comment on public issues.<sup>105</sup> The temperance movement helped to produce many of the early activists in the women's rights movement. Susan B. Anthony and Elizabeth Cady Stanton were early leaders in the American Women's Suffrage movement.<sup>106</sup> For Susan Anthony, her experiences with the temperance movement strengthened her belief that women needed to be able to vote. One of the arguments for advancing women's suffrage included the contention that it would make it easier to pass laws restricting alcohol.<sup>107</sup> Amelia Bloomer led the publication of *The Lily* (the nation's first newspaper for women) and was advocate of women's dress reform.<sup>108</sup> Abigail Allen was an advocate for women's rights; especially in the field of women's access to higher education and

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>101</sup> Frances Elizabeth Willard, *Glimpses of Fifty Years, the Autobiography of an American Woman,* (Chicago: Women's Temperance Publication Association, H.J. Smith & Co., 1889),

https://babel.hathitrust.org/cgi/pt?id=mdp.39015009382931;view=1up;seq=11, 330-394; The Union Signal, Frances E. Willard Centenary Issue, September 28, 1939, Vol. 45. No. 37, 1-14

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>102</sup> Willard, *Glimpses of Fifty Years*, 330-394; District Temperance Union Minutes, 1879-1880, Livingston County Historian's office, Mt. Morris, New York, 1-52; Mattingly, *Well Tempered Women*, 39-64; Minard, *Allegany County and its People*, 199-203

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>103</sup>Lisa Anderson, "Give the Ladies a Chance: Gender and Partisanship in the Prohibition Party, 1869–1912", *Journal of Women's History* 2: 137-161; "1872 Prohibition Party Platform", Prohibitionists.org, Accessed March 21, 2017, <u>http://www.prohibitionists.org/background/party\_platform/Platform1872.htm</u>; Roger Storms, *Partisan Prophets;* A History of the Prohibition Party, (Denver, Colorado: National Prohibition Foundation Inc., 1972), 1-16

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>104</sup> Storms, *Partisan Prophets*, 1-38; Willard, *Glimpses of Fifty Years*, 330-394; Mattingly, *Well Tempered Women*, xiii-64; 143-177

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>105</sup> Lerner, *The Grimké Sisters from South Carolina*, 1-10; 66-79; 116-152; 166-178; Ginzberg, *Women and the work of benevolence*, 60-81; Mattingly, *Well Tempered Women*, xiii-10

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>106</sup> Elizabeth Cady Stanton, Susan B. Anthony; Correspondence, Writings, Speeches, ix-57

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>107</sup> Elizabeth Cady Stanton, Susan B. Anthony; Correspondence, Writings, Speeches, 7-57; 115-176; Mattingly, Well Tempered Women, xiii-74

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>108</sup> "The Lily: A Temperance and Abolitionist Newspaper"; D.C. Bloomer, *Life and Writings of Amelia Bloomer*, 38-54; 65-133; 149-189; Susan J. Kleinberg, "Introduction to the Paperback Edition" *Life and Writings of Amelia Bloomer*, i-xiv; Mattingly, *Well Tempered Women*, 15-32; 106-107

coeducation.<sup>109</sup> The temperance movement helped to develop a consciousness, advocacy skills, and social space, which some women used to advance the place women in American society.

## Youth in Temperance

Part of the development of the temperance movement in Western New York was based in the activity and recruitment of younger citizens. Adolescents and young adults were attracted to the temperance movement for various reasons. Some youth were attracted to the movement from an open-mindedness to new ideas, an optimism for seeking to improve the world, and/ or as a means to developing their own sense of identity and place in the world.<sup>110</sup> In *The Rise and Fall of the American Teenager*, Thomas Hine states that in the period of the Second Great Awakening, there were youths who were attracted to religious reform movements due to them offering a means for claiming mental and social independence from paternal authority, and for claiming moral distinction for oneself.<sup>111</sup> A similar appeal presented itself in the temperance movement. Organizations, such as, the New York State Temperance Society made appeals to young men, claiming that by becoming teetotalers and promoting temperance, that they would become moral leaders, that they could set an example to help reform their fathers, and they could aid in transforming society. These notions, whether by self-initiative or appeal, helped to attract youth supporters who came from outside the temperance sphere.<sup>112</sup>

The temperance movement also drew young supporters through generational connections. First generation abstainers and temperance supporters could seek to teach their ideas and practices to their children. Thus, some temperance supporters came to hold their initial antialcohol views due to their families.<sup>113</sup> Though, with them, such belief still entailed a conscious acceptance of such views as one's own. And those who were raised intemperance families could

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>109</sup> St. Clair Champlin and Babcock, *An Offering to the Memory of Abigail Allen,* 23-37; 49-68; Norwood, *Fiat Lux*, 1-67

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>110</sup> Cole, *Cole's Combined System of Drainage and Irrigation*, 1-22; "Temperance Worker", National Susan B. Anthony Museum and House Website;

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>111</sup> Thomas Hine, *The Rise and Fall of the American Teenager: A New History of the Adolescent Experience,* (New York: Harper Collins, 199), 76-154

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>112</sup> Second Annual Report of the New York State Society for the Promotion of Temperance, 8-87; Flint, An Address To the Buffalo Young Men's Temperance Society, 1-7; 21-27; Clinton, Address of George W. Clinton Delivered Before The Young Men's Temperance Society of Buffalo, March, 6<sup>th</sup>, 1841, 1-10; New York State Temperance Society, *The Temperance Almanac No. 8, For the Year of Our Lord 1841* 

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>113</sup> "Temperance Worker", National Susan B. Anthony Museum and House Website; Mattingly, *Well Tempered Women*, xiii-74; Tyler, *Freedom's Ferment*, 312-324; Cross, *The Burned Over District*, 126-137

also take their temperance views and activities beyond what preceding generations had.<sup>114</sup> For instance, Hiram Burdick went beyond the religious views against drinking liquor, which his parents held, and developed his own set of medical ideas against alcohol.<sup>115</sup> Through a combination of individual conversion and generational teaching, the temperance movement gained a youth element.

The biography of Asahel Cole helps to give an early example of a youth embracing temperance. Asahel Cole was a newspaper producer, agricultural innovator, and anti-slavery politician, who mainly lived in Allegany County.<sup>116</sup> His parents encouraged his education and the practice of independent thinking. At a young age, he be began to form opinions and stances on social and political issues.<sup>117</sup> The description of his youth stated,

"Of his inborn and impulsive radicalism, the reader may judge by a single incident occurring at the age of thirteen, when, entering the village mill, and discovering a paper pinned on the wall with a few names appended to it, all of men of the maturest years, he read it, and finding it a pledge to abstain from the use of alcoholic drinks, he at once added his name to the list, and hence his claim to being one of the earliest among temperance men now living is well founded."<sup>118</sup>

The account indicates that Cole's act of signing onto teetotalism was a result of his democratic reformist thinking, his personality, and the availability of the possibility for him to consider. Likewise, it seems that this instance was mark of his personal development into the kind of man he was; a self-guided, intellectually active and confident figure, who pursued his passions and championed causes dear to him. Furthermore, his action presented himself in social proximity with older more established men, and consequently acted to help build his status in the adult world.<sup>119</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>114</sup> "Temperance Worker", National Susan B. Anthony Museum and House Website; Mattingly, *Well Tempered Women*, xiii-74; *Freedom's Ferment*, 308-350

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>115</sup> Phelan, *Allegany's Uncommon Folk*, 90-97; "Rev. Hiram Burdick; This Pioneer Physician and Clergyman Died at His Home on Hartsville Hill"; *Alfred Yearbook 1903-1904*, 113-114

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>116</sup> Cole, *Cole's Combined System of Drainage and Irrigation*, 1-22; Asahel N. Cole, *The New Agriculture; or, the Waters Held Captive*. New York: The American Angler, William C. Harris and H. H. Thomson, 1885. <u>https://babel.hathitrust.org/cgi/pt?id=uc2.ark:/13960/t0vq2vt52;view=1up;seq=122</u>, 11-14; 100-134

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>117</sup> Cole, *Cole's Combined System of Drainage and Irrigation*, 1-28

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>118</sup> Cole, *Cole's Combined System of Drainage and Irrigation*, 13

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>119</sup> Cole, *Cole's Combined System of Drainage and Irrigation*, 1-22

Advocates and groups within the temperance movement actively sought to convince youth to adopt temperance ideas, abstain from alcohol, and become temperance activists. This was done with an understanding that promoting temperance to youth in their formative period could affect lifelong thinking and behavior, and by changing the views of the next generation, it could help to produce a more pro-temperance society in the future.<sup>120</sup> In the cities of Buffalo and Rochester, young men's temperance societies were established by the 1840's.<sup>121</sup> Various county level organizations had young men, women, and people's societies incorporated as auxiliaries, or integrated members of the general organization.<sup>122</sup> The effectiveness of these efforts varied. Some youth remained active in the temperance movement in some manor throughout their lives, or at least remained abstainers. Other youth, as with some adults, temporarily tried abstinence and temperance, but later abandoned it. Though among those among those who remained active, they helped to shape the future of the movement, and some grew to become innovative and leading figures.<sup>123</sup>

As the 19<sup>th</sup> century progressed, there was a general aggregate buildup of support in the temperance movement and pro-temperance cultural transformation over the course of the century. And as the temperance movement progressed, succeeding generations of temperance supporters played a part in the shift toward greater teetotalism and prohibitionism within the movement.<sup>124</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>120</sup> New York State Temperance Society, *The Temperance Almanac No. 8, For the Year of Our Lord 1841; Second Annual Report of the New York State Society for the Promotion of Temperance,* 8-87; Eli F. Brown, *Youth's temperance manual: an elementary physiology : prepared with special reference to the nature of alcoholic drinks and narcotics, and their effects upon the human system, and in accordance with the requirements of the Woman's Christian Temperance Union, (New York: American Book Co, 1888), i-iv; 26-36; 75-86; Edward Hitchcock, An argument for early temperance; addressed to the youth of the United States.* By Edward Hitchcock...Altered and enl. from his prize essay on temperance, (Boston: Whipple and Damrell, 1837), 30-68

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>121</sup> Flint, *An Address To the Buffalo Young Men's Temperance Society*, 1-7; 21-27; Clinton, Address of George W. Clinton Delivered Before The Young Men's Temperance Society of Buffalo, March, 6<sup>th</sup>, 1841, 1-10; Johnson, *A Shopkeeper's Millennium*, 133

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>122</sup> Second Annual Report of the New York State Society for the Promotion of Temperance, 8-87

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>123</sup> "Temperance Worker", National Susan B. Anthony Museum and House Website; Mattingly, *Well Tempered Women*, xiii-74; *Freedom's Ferment*, 308-350; Walters, *American Reformers* 1815-1860, 123-144

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>124</sup> Freedom's Ferment, 308-350; Walters, American Reformers 1815-1860, 123-144; Mattingly, Well Tempered Women, xiii-74

#### The Beginning Formation of Temperance Thinking and Activism

The Temperance Movement began to emerge in Western New York near the beginning of the 19<sup>th</sup> century. It is uncertain exactly when the first temperance thinkers and advocates had appeared in Western New York. There were temperance advocates and groups in parts of Western New York at least as early as the 1820's.<sup>125</sup> By the 1830's, there were advocates and groups in many communities across Western New York. In 1831, The New York State Temperance Society reported over 10,000 members among its local auxiliaries in Western New York.<sup>126</sup> The times when the temperance movement reached certain individuals and communities varied. Though it is safe to say that most communities in Western New York had some sort of temperance presence by the 1840's.<sup>127</sup>

The main types of reasons why people became attracted to temperance in this period, have been largely laid out in previous sections. The late 18<sup>th</sup> and 19<sup>th</sup> centuries saw a massive increase in alcohol use, and consequently an increase in alcohol-related problems.<sup>128</sup> The experience and witnessing of alcohol related problems, such as people being made sick or killed by alcohol use, families put in poverty by drinking, and alcohol related crimes, had increased individual and public concern.<sup>129</sup> Figures involved in medicine, religious revivalism, academics, charity, and business produced new information and claims of the harms caused by alcohol.<sup>130</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>125</sup> Johnson, A Shopkeeper's Millennium, 4-5; 55-61; 75-94; 121-133; Cross, The Burned Over District, 87-258

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>126</sup> Second Annual Report of the New York State Society for the Promotion of Temperance, 13-85

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>127</sup> Cross, The Burned Over District, 87-258; Second Annual Report of the New York State Society for the Promotion of Temperance, 13-85; Tyler, Freedom's Ferment, 322-350; New-York State Temperance Society. American quarterly temperance magazine. Vol. 1-2, 9-13

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>128</sup> Tyler, *Freedom's Ferment*, 308-312; W.G. Calderwood, *Temperance Facts*, (Minneapolis: Minnesota Temperance Movement, 1940), https://babel.hathitrust.org/cgi/pt?id=mdp.39015071420817;view=1up;seq=2, 6-7

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>129</sup> Strong, The Most Natural Way in the World, 461; Tyler, *Freedom's Ferment*, 308-312; Flint, *An Address To the Buffalo Young Men's Temperance Society*, 1-18; Clinton, Address of George W. Clinton Delivered Before The Young Men's Temperance Society of Buffalo, March, 6<sup>th</sup>, 1841, 1-16; Clinton, *Address Delivered By George W. Clinton At the Dedication of Erie Tent No. 30, I.O. of R. Of The City Of Buffalo, Friday, October 24, 1845, 1-16* 

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>130</sup> Johnson, A Shopkeeper's Millennium, 55-61; 75-94; 121-133; Cross, The Burned Over District, 1-53; 68-148; 187-321; Tyler, Freedom's Ferment, 68-85; 308-350; Flint, An Address To the Buffalo Young Men's Temperance Society, 1-18; Clinton, Address of George W. Clinton Delivered Before The Young Men's Temperance Society of Buffalo, March, 6<sup>th</sup>, 1841, 1-16; Clinton, Address Delivered By George W. Clinton At the Dedication of Erie Tent No. 30, I.O. of R. Of The City Of Buffalo, Friday, October 24, 1845, 1-16; Mohl, Poverty in New York, 1783-1825,116-133; 211-225; McNamara, A Century of Grace, 39-52; 106; 208; Mattingly, Well Tempered Women, xiii-74; Walters, American Reformers 1815-1860, 18-58; 123-143; Rush, An Inquiry into the Effects of Ardent Spirits on the Human Mind and Body, 8th ed.; "Rev. Hiram Burdick; This Pioneer Physician and Clergyman Died at His Home on Hartsville Hill"; Alfred Yearbook 1903-1904, 113-114; Dormer, Mr. Dormer's Address: Economic Aspects Of The Liquor Traffic, 1-15; Minard, Allegany County and its People, 633-647; Abigale Allen, Life and Sermons of Jonathan Allen, 40-47; 90-151;

The combination of various mental influences helped encourage people to believe that alcohol was a harmful substance, which could poison the mind, body, and/or spirit.

Initially, temperance figured tended to focus on moderating alcohol use and on the dangers of distilled alcohol. Early figures such Benjamin Rush had held this focus.<sup>131</sup> By the 1830's the idea of total abstinence (teetotalism) began to promoted by some temperance thinkers, and some temperance thinkers gradually moved to declare that non-distilled forms of alcohol, such as beer, malts, and wine were also harmful and should be rejected.<sup>132</sup> As the century progressed some local figures such as Hiram Burdick, Joel Wakeman, and George Clinton promoted teetotalism and helped to make teetotalism the predominant temperance stance by the mid to late 19<sup>th</sup> century.<sup>133</sup>

The initial tactics of temperance activists were largely based on spreading information about the harms of alcohol and encouraging individuals to voluntarily embrace temperance.<sup>134</sup> In some instances the example of prominent individuals, such as Lyman Beecher, was used to encourage temperance. By the mid 1820's some businessman began to ban workers from drinking on the job.<sup>135</sup> As the century progressed, temperance advocates came to increasingly regard alcohol related problems as a public issue rather than a merely private issue. They came to increasingly regard the public availability of alcohol and the interests of the alcohol industry as

<sup>173-200;</sup> Strong, The Most Natural Way in the World, 460-465; Alfred Historical Society and Baker's Bridge Association, *History of Alfred, New York*, 47-48; Norwood, *Fiat Lux*, 1-67; St. Clair Champlin and Babcock, *An Offering to the Memory of Abigail Allen*, 44-59; Abigail Allen, *Life and Sermons of Jonathan Allen*, 41; Susan Rumsey Strong, *Thought Know No Sex*, 36-51; Irish, Manuscript of Speech delivered by James R. Irish on Jan 1, 1838, before the Alfred Total-Abstinence Society, Alfred, 1-15

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>131</sup> Walters, American Reformers 1815-1860, 125; Tyler, Freedom's Ferment, 314-316; Walters, American Reformers 1815-1860, 125; Rush, An Inquiry into the Effects of Ardent Spirits on the Human Mind and Body, 8th ed.
 <sup>132</sup> Tyler, Freedom's Ferment, 322-350; Cross, The Burned Over District, 130-258

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>133</sup> "Rev. Hiram Burdick; This Pioneer Physician and Clergyman Died at His Home on Hartsville Hill"; Alfred Yearbook 1903-1904, 113-114; Clinton, Address of George W. Clinton Delivered Before The Young Men's Temperance Society of Buffalo, March, 6<sup>th</sup>, 1841, 1-16; Clinton, Address Delivered By George W. Clinton At the Dedication of Erie Tent No. 30, I.O. of R. Of The City Of Buffalo, Friday, October 24, 1845, 1-16; Wakeman, The Mysterious Parchment, 1-321; Wakeman, The Golden Horn, 1-456; Phelan, "Bibliography" IF Our Earthly Dissolve

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>134</sup> Tyler, *Freedom's Ferment*, 312-350; S.L. Holmes, *Address on the Temperance Pledge*, (Albany: Carol and Cook, 1843), <u>https://babel.hathitrust.org/cgi/pt?id=hvd.hwissn;view=1up;seq=8</u>; Cross, *The Burned Over District*, 130-258

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>135</sup> Johnson, A Shopkeeper's Millennium, 4-5; 55-61; 75-94; 121-133

impediment to advancing temperance, and came to embrace policies to restrict and prohibit the manufacture and sale of alcohol.<sup>136</sup>

## **The Temperance Pledge**

The temperance pledge was one of the key features and tools of temperance activity in the 19<sup>th</sup> and early 20th century. This was the case in Western New York, as well as across the United States and in a number of other countries, such as the United Kingdom.<sup>137</sup> The temperance pledge consisted of a piece of paper, on which an oath was written and the person vowing to moderate/ abstain from alcohol would voluntarily sign. The particular content of temperance pledges varied depending on the circumstances. Some temperance pledges were hand written, while others were printed for signature.<sup>138</sup> While temperance pledges were often individual, there were also temperance pledges only pledged for moderation or abstinence from particular types of alcohol, others called for total abstinence from alcohol, and some pledges additionally called for abstinence from other substances as well (such as narcotics, tobacco, coffee, or tea).<sup>140</sup> Some temperance pledges also contained an additional affirmation that one would not produce alcohol, sell it, or support people who did so. Some temperance pledges also

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>136</sup> Johnson, A Shopkeeper's Millennium, 55-61; 75-94; 121-133; Cross, The Burned Over District, 1-53; 68-148; 187-321; Tyler, Freedom's Ferment, 308-350; Wakeman, The Mysterious Parchment, 1-321; Henry S. Clubb, The Maine liquor law; its origin, history, and results, including a life of Hon. Neal Dow, (New York: Pub. for the Maine Law Statistical Society, by Fowler and Wells, 1856), <u>https://babel.hathitrust.org/cgi/pt?id=uc2.ark:/13960/t3fx76t0v</u>, 1-210; James Shaw, History of the Great Temperance Reforms of the 19<sup>th</sup> Century, (Cincinnati: Walden and Stowe, 1917),

https://books.google.com/books?id=sypLAQAAMAAJ&printsec=frontcover&dq=books+on+the+history+of+19th+c entury+american+temperance&hl=en&sa=X&ved=OahUKEwiNy772i8HNAhXGOh4KHdWtCWA4ChDoAQgzMAM#v= onepage&q=books%20on%20the%20history%20of%2019th%20century%20american%20temperance&f=false, 124-161

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>137</sup> Tyler, *Freedom's Ferment*, 312-350; Holmes, *Address on the Temperance Pledge*; William Herries PhD., *The Temperance Pledge Violated by the New York Carson League*, (New York: A. Ranney, 1855), https://babel.hathitrust.org/cgi/pt?id=hvd.32044088977764;view=1up;seq=5, 5-7

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>138</sup> Alfred Temperance Pledges, Temperance Collection, Alfred University Archives, Alfred, New York; Certificate of Membership Pledge for the Sons of Temperance Organization Division Leicester No. 80, Signed by S.S. Westlake, November 25<sup>th</sup> 1851, Westlake FF-B3-904, Family Files Original Series, Box 3, Folder 71, Livingston County Historian's office, Mt. Morris, New York; Wakeman, *The Mysterious Parchment*, 138-140; 230

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>139</sup> Cole, *Cole's Combined System of Drainage and Irrigation*, 13; Wakeman, *The Golden Horn*, 139-149; 251-286; 331-343; Wakeman, *The Mysterious Parchment*, 138-140; Alfred Temperance Pledges; Pledge Of The Land Of Hope, Pledge by Members of the Sabbath School at Alfred Centre, 1877, Alfred University Archives, Alfred, New York

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>140</sup> Tyler, *Freedom's Ferment*, 327-330; Wakeman, *The Mysterious Parchment*, 138-140; Alfred Temperance Pledges; Pledge Of The Land Of Hope

stated that the signor would also personally promote temperance and do what was in their power to combat the liquor traffic.<sup>141</sup>

To help illustrate this, here are some examples of what the wording of temperance pledges were:

"We the subscribers reading in the \_\_\_\_\_ in the county of \_\_\_\_\_ believing the drinking or ardent spirits is, for persons in health, not only unnecessary but injurious, and that its use is the cause of forming intemperate appetites and habits, and while it is continued the evils of intemperance can never be prevented, do therefor agree, that we will not, except as medicine in case of bodily infirmity, use distilled spirits ourselves, or procure them for the use of our families, or provide them for the entertainment of our friends or for persons in our employment: and that in all suitable ways we will discountenance the use of them in the community."<sup>142</sup>

"we do solemnly pledge that from this time forward our honor. that we shall neither make, buy, sell, use, nor countenance the use or sale of any Intoxicating Liquor as a beverage."<sup>143</sup>

"I hereby solemnly promise to abstain from the use of Intoxicating Liquors as a beverage: I also promise to abstain from the use of Tobacco in all forms, and all Profane Language."<sup>144</sup>

"We whose names are hitherto annexed, solemnly pledge ourselves that we will carefully abstain from the use of spirituous liquors, strong beer, wines, and cider; and so far as we are able will discountance their use in others."<sup>145</sup>

The temperance pledge had become a feature of American temperance activity as early the 1820's. In May 1833, the American temperance Society held a national meeting in Philadelphia. During this meeting debates erupted over what the national society's standard temperance pledge would be. The main body agreed at the time to a pledge containing abstinence from distilled alcohol. But, there was a minority which had wanted the pledge to only demand moderation and a significant minority had wanted to broaden the pledge to include abstinence

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>141</sup> Alfred Temperance Pledges; Wakeman, *The Mysterious Parchment*, 138-140

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>142</sup> New-York State Temperance Society. American quarterly temperance magazine. Vol. 1-2, 7

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>143</sup> Alfred Temperance Pledges

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>144</sup> Pledge Of The Land Of Hope

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>145</sup> Wakeman, The Mysterious Parchment, 138-140

from malt and fermented alcoholic beverages.<sup>146</sup> At this time, there were temperance advocates in New York state who were advocating for teetotal temperance pledges, and these pledges began to be introduced by various local groups in the 1830's and 40's.<sup>147</sup> As the century progressed, teetotal temperance pledges gradually grew to become the generally predominant style of temperance pledge.<sup>148</sup>

State and local temperance advocates and organizations commonly made use of temperance pledges to promote temperance, get people to abstain from alcohol, recruit supporters, and to have a public marker for the cause.<sup>149</sup> For instance, Dr. John Collins and compatriots in Alfred had persuaded over 500 people, between 1830 and 1844 to sign total abstinence pledges. This helped to build a base within the community to shut down all alcohol establishments in the town.<sup>150</sup> The Sons of Temperance included the temperance pledge as part of joining their fraternal organization.<sup>151</sup> Washingtonian style temperance groups (groups which were composed of former 'drunkards' who were committed to helping other drinkers become abstinent), as well as individual reformed drinkers and groups who embraced aspects of Washingtonian methods, encouraged signors of temperance pledges to become advocates for temperance.<sup>152</sup> The Women's Christian Temperance Union included the promotion of the temperance pledge as one of their functions.<sup>153</sup> The temperance pledge thus constituted an important tool for temperance advocates.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>146</sup>Tyler, *Freedom's Ferment*, 316-335; Cross, *The Burned Over District*, 130-137

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>147</sup> Tyler, *Freedom's Ferment*, 316-335; Cross, *The Burned Over District*, 130-137; Minard, *Allegany County and its People*, 633-647

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>148</sup> Tyler, *Freedom's Ferment*, 316-335; Cross, *The Burned Over District*, 130-137; Minard, *Allegany County and its People*, 633-647; Tyler, *Freedom's Ferment*, 327-330; Wakeman, *The Mysterious Parchment*, 32-86; 125-149; 172-174; 271-320; Alfred Temperance Pledges; Pledge Of The Land Of Hope; Holmes, *Address on the Temperance Pledge*, 1-20; Herries, *The Temperance Pledge Violated* 

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>149</sup> Tyler, Freedom's Ferment, 316-335; Minard, Allegany County and its People, 633-647; Second Annual Report of the New York State Society for the Promotion of Temperance, 21-95

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>150</sup>Minard, Allegany County and its People, 633-647

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>151</sup> Sons of Temperance of North America. *Journal of proceedings of the National Division of the Sons of Temperance of North America Vol. 1.* Philadelphia: Jos. Severns & Co., 1844. <u>https://babel.hathitrust.org/cgi/pt/search?q1=pledge;id=iau.31858034301840;view=1up;seq=1;start=21;sz=10;page=search;orient=0, 6-61</u>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>152</sup>Tyler, *Freedom's Ferment*, 316-335; Wakeman, *The Mysterious Parchment*, 1-21; 130-230; New York State Temperance Society, *The Temperance Almanac For the Year of Our Lord* 1845

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>153</sup> Willard, *Glimpses of Fifty Years*, 330-394; *Women's Christian Temperance Union of Livingston County New York Constitution and By-Laws*, Livingston County Historian's office, Mt. Morris, New York

The temperance pledge also held significance for the individual signing it. For people who were already abstinent, it served as personal and public symbol for their commitment to not drink. For those who had previously been drinkers, it served as a personal symbol of their commitment to no longer drink. It symbolized their act of will to overcome and deny the desires which encouraged them to drink.<sup>154</sup> It could serve to remind them of the reasons why they committed not to drink. It also aided them on a social level. The temperance pledge symbolized a commitment to stop drinking and therefore could act to remove stigma for those who chose to stop drinking. When there were temperance groups present, the temperance pledge could be used to help the individual to call upon this social support to help them to keep their commitment to not drink.<sup>155</sup> As such, the temperance pledge symbolically, psychologically, and socially functioned to help the individual abstain from drinking.

How effective were temperance pledges? The answer is mixed. The temperance pledge was a voluntary action. If an individual chose or was influenced toward violating the pledge and had the means to procure alcohol, then it might be broken. If a person continued to choose to keep the pledge and possessed enough personal fortitude and social support to counteract influences toward drinking, then the individual would keep the temperance pledge. Thus, the temperance pledge was sometimes effective in the long term, and sometimes only effective in the short term; depending on the individual's circumstances.<sup>156</sup> It uncertain how many of those people in Western New York who signed temperance pledges kept them for the remainder of their lives and how many abandoned their pledges. Though it can still be inferred from the growth of the temperance movement and its consistent use by advocates and organizations throughout the century, that a large enough portion kept the pledges to convince the main body of the temperance movement that the temperance pledge was a good enough practice to continue using it.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>154</sup> Clinton, Address of George W. Clinton Delivered Before The Young Men's Temperance Society of Buffalo, March, 6<sup>th</sup>, 1841, 1-16; Wakeman, *The Mysterious Parchment*, 1-21; 32-86; 125-230; 271-320; Flint, *An Address To the Buffalo Young Men's Temperance Society*, 11-18; Holmes, *Address on the Temperance Pledge*; Herries, *The Temperance Pledge Violated* 

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>155</sup> Clinton, Address of George W. Clinton Delivered Before The Young Men's Temperance Society of Buffalo, March, 6<sup>th</sup>, 1841, 1-16; Wakeman, *The Mysterious Parchment*, 1-21; 32-86; 125-230; 271-320; Flint, *An Address To the Buffalo Young Men's Temperance Society*, 11-18; Holmes, *Address on the Temperance Pledge*; Herries, *The Temperance Pledge Violated*; Minard, *Allegany County and its People*, 633-647

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>156</sup>Flint, An Address To the Buffalo Young Men's Temperance Society, 11-18; Holmes, Address on the Temperance Pledge; Herries, The Temperance Pledge Violated; Clinton, Address of George W. Clinton Delivered Before The Young Men's Temperance Society of Buffalo, March, 6<sup>th</sup>, 1841, 1-16

## **Temperance Organizations**

The promotion and development of the temperance movement in Western New York was advanced by a variety of groups and organization on the local and statewide levels. The constitution of organizations, in terms of the particular organizations and their prominence, varied over time. Different organizations were created, rose operated, and disbanded, at differing times. Likewise, the vitality and social presence of organizations fluctuated. Though, overall the presence of local statewide temperance organizations grew over the century.

Local temperance organizations began appearing in New York state as early as 1808. In 1808, Dr. Billy Clark organized the Union Temperance Society of Monroe and Northumberland near Glenn Falls.<sup>157</sup> Temperance organizations began forming in Western New York as early as the 1820's.<sup>158</sup> Between 1825 and 1855, local temperance organizations proliferated, and came to have a presence in most communities.<sup>159</sup> Some organizations acted as independent bodies, while others were affiliated with larger organizations such as the New York State Temperance Society and the Sons of Temperance, as well as the Women's Christian Temperance Union in later part of the century.<sup>160</sup>

Local organizations tended to be composed of community members, who for one reason or another were concerned about the problems of alcohol and wanted to contribute to temperance efforts. Collectively, local organizations drew members from across the community; including farmers, laborers, businessman, ministers, doctors, lawyers, writers, teachers, politicians, men, women, youth, et cetera. Though some organizations were selected their membership from certain groups of people and/or according to additional membership requirements. The activities of these organizations could include giving pro-temperance speeches, distributing temperance

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>157</sup> Calderwood, *Temperance Facts*, 84; Tyler, *Freedom's Ferment*, 314

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>158</sup> Johnson, A Shopkeeper's Millennium, 75-94; 121-133

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>159</sup> Cross, The Burned Over District, 87-258; Second Annual Report of the New York State Society for the Promotion of Temperance, 13-85; Tyler, Freedom's Ferment, 322-350; New-York State Temperance Society. American quarterly temperance magazine. Vol. 1-2, 9-13; Clubb, The Maine liquor law, 1-210

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>160</sup> Lakeville Temperance Society Minute Book, 1828-1840, Livingston County Historian's office. Mt. Morris, New York; Second Annual Report of the New York State Society for the Promotion of Temperance, 13-85; New-York State Temperance Society. American quarterly temperance magazine. Vol. 1-2, 1-96; <sup>160</sup>Sons of Temperance of North America. Journal of proceedings of the National Division of the Sons of Temperance of North America Vol. 1, 1-61; Willard, Glimpses of Fifty Years, 330-394; Minard, Allegany County and its People, 199-203

literature, gathering petition signatures, hosting social events and fundraisers, and other activities typical of a community organization.<sup>161</sup>

There were various statewide organizations which had a considerable presence in Western New York. Notable organizations include the New York State Temperance Society, the Sons of Temperance, the Woman's New York State Temperance Society, and the Women's Christian Temperance Union.

The New York State Temperance Society was founded in 1830. By 1831, it had local a presence in most counties, had hundreds of local affiliates, and tens of thousands of members. Of those, over 10,000 members were in Western New York.<sup>162</sup> The organization was notable in establishing state wide temperance publications and forming connections with temperance activists nationally and internationally.<sup>163</sup>

The Sons of Temperance was a fraternal temperance organization founded in New York City in 1842. The organization quickly expanded in the following decade to become an international organization, with thousands of lodges across the world.<sup>164</sup> The organization had members in Western New York as early as 1844.<sup>165</sup> Due to its size and organization, the Sons of Temperance were well involved in the area's temperance movement in the 1840'sand 50's. For a time the Sons of temperance had a female division of the organization, called the Daughters of

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>161</sup> Minard, *Allegany County and its People*, 199-203; Lakeville Temperance Society Minute Book, 1828-1840, Livingston County Historian's office. Mt. Morris, New York; District Temperance Union Minutes, 1879-1880, 1-52; Cross, *The Burned Over District*, 87-258; *Second Annual Report of the New York State Society for the Promotion of Temperance*, *13-85;* Tyler, *Freedom's Ferment*, 322-350; New-York State Temperance Society. *American quarterly temperance magazine*. *Vol. 1-2*, 1-96; Johnson, *A Shopkeeper's Millennium*, 75-94; 121-133; Phelan, "Bibliography", *IF Our Earthly Dissolve;* "Rev. Hiram Burdick; This Pioneer Physician and Clergyman Died at His Home on Hartsville Hill"; *Alfred Yearbook 1903-1904*, 113-114; Irish, Manuscript of Speech delivered by James R. Irish on Jan 1, 1838, before the Alfred Total-Abstinence Society, 1-56; Clinton, *Address Delivered By George W. Clinton At the Dedication of Erie Tent No. 30, I.O. of R. Of The City Of Buffalo, Friday, October 24, 1845*, 1-8; Flint, *An Address To the Buffalo Young Men's Temperance Society*, 1-16

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>162</sup> Second Annual Report of the New York State Society for the Promotion of Temperance, 13-85

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>163</sup> Second Annual Report of the New York State Society for the Promotion of Temperance, 13-85; New-York State Temperance Society. American quarterly temperance magazine. Vol. 1-2, 1-96

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>164</sup>Sons of Temperance of North America. *Journal of proceedings of the National Division of the Sons of Temperance of North America Vol. 1,* 1-61; Shaw, *History of the Great Temperance Reforms of the* 19<sup>th</sup> Century, 165-166

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>165</sup> Certificate of Membership Pledge for the Sons of Temperance Organization Division Leicester No. 80, Signed by S.S. Westlake; Sons of Temperance of North America. *Journal of proceedings of the National Division of the Sons of Temperance of North America Vol. 1,* 1-61; Shaw, *History of the Great Temperance Reforms of the 19<sup>th</sup> Century,* 165-166

Temperance.<sup>166</sup> In 1849, Susan B. Anthony became president of the Rochester branch of the Daughters of Temperance. Though later she was prevented from speaking at a Son's of Temperance convention Albany. This led her to leave the organization and help found the Woman's New York State Temperance Society.<sup>167</sup>

The Woman's New York State Temperance Society was founded in Rochester in 1852. It was initially founded by a group of 500 women, including Susan B. Anthony, Elizabeth Cady Stanton, and Amelia Bloomer.<sup>168</sup> The organization formed connection with various local women's temperance organizations which had been created in the 1840's, due to the tendency of organizations such as the New York State temperance Society and the Sons of Temperance to marginalize female activists.<sup>169</sup> The Woman's New York State Temperance Society helped to further mobilize female activists in the state. In 1853, they gathered 28,000 signatures for a petition to the state legislature demanding the passage of greater restrictions on the sale of liquor.<sup>170</sup> The organization also expanded coverage the ways that women were negatively affected by the intemperance of their husbands.<sup>171</sup>

The Women's Christian Temperance Union was founded in Ohio, by Frances Willard in 1873. In the following decade, the WCTU expanded across much of the nation.<sup>172</sup> The first WCTU chapter in Western New York was formed in Chautauqua County in December of 1873. By 1880, there were WCTU chapters in many of the counties and communities in the area.<sup>173</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>166</sup> Sons of Temperance of North America. *Journal of proceedings of the National Division of the Sons of Temperance of North America Vol. 1,* 1-61; Shaw, *History of the Great Temperance Reforms of the* 19<sup>th</sup> Century, 165-166

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>167</sup>"Temperance Worker"; Mattingly, Well Tempered Women, xiii-38

Susan B Anthony was a prominent social reformer, based in the Seneca Falls- Rochester area, most known for her role in championing the Women's Suffrage movement. She was more broadly involved in the women's rights, temperance, and anti-slavery movements.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>168</sup> "Woman's New York State Temperance Society"; D.C. Bloomer, *Life and Writings of Amelia Bloomer*, 84-86; *Elizabeth Cady Stanton, Susan B. Anthony; Correspondence, Writings, Speeches*, 17-57

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>169</sup>"Woman's New York State Temperance Society"; Mattingly, *Well Tempered Women*, xiii-38; *Elizabeth Cady Stanton, Susan B. Anthony; Correspondence, Writings, Speeches*, 17-57

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>170</sup> Mattingly, Well Tempered Women, xiii-74; 'Woman's New York State Temperance Society"

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>171</sup> Mattingly, Well Tempered Women, xiii-74; 'Woman's New York State Temperance Society"

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>172</sup> Willard, *Glimpses of Fifty Years*, 330-394

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>173</sup> Minard, Allegany County and its People, 199-203

The WCTU chapters would play an important role in the late 19<sup>th</sup> century, by promoting the infusion of temperance into local culture and in promoting support for National Prohibition.<sup>174</sup>

## The Emergence and Shift Toward Teetotalism

As the temperance movement progressed, the notion of teetotalism emerged, and gradually grew in adherence to become the predominant segment of the temperance movement in Western New York.<sup>175</sup> In the early decades of the American temperance movement, in the late 18<sup>th</sup> and early 19<sup>th</sup> century, the predominant early strain of temperance consisted on support for the moderation of drinking and focused mainly on the issue of distilled alcohol.<sup>176</sup> Though by the at least the late 1820's there were temperance advocates who contended that other forms of alcohol were harmful and that the harms of alcohol didn't merely come from excessive use, but were the product of the nature of these alcoholic beverages.<sup>177</sup> These ideas led people to conclude that total abstinence from alcohol (teetotalism) should be embraced. Subsequent Ideas about the mental and moral harm of alcohol, combined with notions of moral obligation and the capacity to reform man, to declare the promotion of teetotalism to be a moral cause.<sup>178</sup>

By the 1830's prominent temperance advocates in New York state, including Gerrit Smith, E. C. Delvan, and Lewis Tappan, worked to push forward support for total abstinence from all that intoxicates, and had attempted to steer the mainstream temperance movement toward their position. In addition, Lewis Tappan advocated the use of unfermented grape juice, rather than wine, in religious sacraments.<sup>179</sup> The popularity of teetotalism in Western New York

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>174</sup> Willard, *Glimpses of Fifty Years*, 330-394; Minard, *Allegany County and its People*, 199-203; Mattingly, *Well Tempered Women*, 39-74; 171-172; District Temperance Union Minutes, 1879-1880, 1-52; "Eighty One Women Started W.C.T.U. Here Sixty-Three Years Ago"

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>175</sup> Cross, *The Burned Over District*, 87-258; Tyler, *Freedom's Ferment*, 308-350; Walters, *American Reformers* 1815-1860, 123-143

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>176</sup> Tyler, Freedom's Ferment, 308-327; Walters, American Reformers 1815-1860, 123-143

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>177</sup> Tyler, Freedom's Ferment, 322-350; Johnson, A Shopkeeper's Millennium, 55-61; 75-94; 121-133

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>178</sup> Tyler, *Freedom's Ferment,* 322-350; Cross, *The Burned Over District,* 87-258; "Rev. Hiram Burdick; This Pioneer Physician and Clergyman Died at His Home on Hartsville Hill"; *Alfred Yearbook 1903-1904,* 113-114; Flint, *An Address To the Buffalo Young Men's Temperance Society,* 1-18; Clinton, Address of George W. Clinton Delivered Before The Young Men's Temperance Society of Buffalo, March, 6<sup>th</sup>, 1841, 1-16; Clinton, *Address Delivered By George W. Clinton At the Dedication of Erie Tent No. 30, I.O. of R. Of The City Of Buffalo, Friday, October 24, 1845,* 1-16

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>179</sup> Tyler, Freedom's Ferment, 327-328

Tappan's advocacy was initially met with limited support, though various religious denominations would come to adopt the religious interpretation that unfermented grape juice was the proper sacrament matter, and become denominationally dry.

expanded over the following decades, and by the 1870's had become the predominant position among temperance advocates and organizations.<sup>180</sup>

This shift toward teetotalism took benefit from the intellectual contributions of people within Western New York.

Buffalo area temperance supporters, George Clinton and Dr. Austin Flint contended that the qualitative aspects of different forms of alcohol were elementally the same. To draw a line calling some alcoholic beverages intoxicating and others not was not sensible. The only sensible way to avoid intemperance was to abstain from all types of alcohol. It was furthermore contended that the problems caused by intemperance were inherently tied to alcohol.<sup>181</sup> Austin Flint declared that there was an "invariable relation which exists between the cause and the effect", and while there were varying conditions and circumstances leading to intemperance, that the link of alcohol to intoxication and intemperance was constant.<sup>182</sup>

Hiram Burdick promoted teetotalism, in part, on medical arguments. As previously noted, he was a practitioner of Cold Water Medicine. He believed that the health of the body effected the mental and spiritual health of the person. On this basis, the contended that alcohol was comprehensively destructive to a person, and should be rejected for a healthy life.<sup>183</sup>

Academic figures, such as James Irish and Jonathan Allen, promoted total abstinence. Irish stated that intemperance was the king of vices and produced an engine of death. He contended that alcohol, "clad in whatever disguise it may be", was the key driving force of intemperance.<sup>184</sup> Jonathan Allen promoted temperance academically, as well as by going from place to place discussion and debating with people in the effort to convince them of the evils of

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>180</sup> Cross, The Burned Over District, 87-258; Tyler, Freedom's Ferment, 308-350; Walters, American Reformers 1815-1860, 123-143; Second Annual Report of the New York State Society for the Promotion of Temperance, 13-85; New-York State Temperance Society. American quarterly temperance magazine. Vol. 1-2, 1-96; Willard, Glimpses of Fifty Years, 330-394; Minard, Allegany County and its People, 199-203

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>181</sup>Flint, An Address To the Buffalo Young Men's Temperance Society, 1-18; Clinton, Address of George W. Clinton Delivered Before The Young Men's Temperance Society of Buffalo, March, 6<sup>th</sup>, 1841, 1-16; Clinton, Address Delivered By George W. Clinton At the Dedication of Erie Tent No. 30, I.O. of R. Of The City Of Buffalo, Friday, October 24, 1845, 1-16

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>182</sup> Flint, An Address To the Buffalo Young Men's Temperance Society, 10-11

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>183</sup> "Rev. Hiram Burdick; This Pioneer Physician and Clergyman Died at His Home on Hartsville Hill"; *Alfred Yearbook* 1903-1904, 113-114; Phelan, *Allegany's Uncommon Folk*, 84-102

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>184</sup>Irish, Manuscript of Speech delivered by James R. Irish on Jan 1, 1838, 1-15

intemperance. Allen was a teetotaler from youth, who regarded alcohol as a destroyer of life and potential, and regarded teetotalism as a marker of sensibility and strength of character.<sup>185</sup>

Rev Joel Wakeman's writings from the 1850's to 80's promoted the idea that all alcohol was by nature intoxicating.<sup>186</sup> He contended wine was a harmful intoxicant, which led to intemperance, and that the Bible when correctly interpreted condemned the use of wine.<sup>187</sup> He asserted that there was no such thing as safe moderate drinking. Everyone who used alcohol in any form was at risk of becoming a drunkard, and at risk of being distorted by alcohol into committing unwise and wrong actions.<sup>188</sup> Though he also embraced the Washingtonian notion that any drinker could be reformed, if given the proper motivation and support.<sup>189</sup>

These individuals also help to illustrate some of the reasons teetotalism could be embraced by people at the time. The particular combination of ideas and beliefs which constituted an individual's teetotaler views varied among different people. Though it tended to contain common themes in regards to believing that alcohol was harmful and that the issue held moral and public significances.

## **The Prohibitionist Shift**

Alongside the shift toward teetotalism, the shift toward prohibitionism constituted one of the key changes in the temperance movement. The prohibitionist shift entailed the emergence of the idea to impose legal restrictions and prohibitions on the alcohol industry, and the process by which support for prohibitionism became widespread.

The early temperance movement was heavily characterized by individual persuasion. Temperance activists sought to convince people individually to abandon the use of alcohol and to not be involved with the alcohol industry. Speaking, writing, public information campaigns, temperance pledges, and voluntary associations were the hallmark of activity. This reflected the popularity of moral suasion at time, as well as confidence in the ability to reform people and

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>185</sup> Abigail Allen, *Life and Sermons of Jonathan Allen*, 41; 174

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>186</sup> Wakeman, The Mysterious Parchment, 1-321; Wakeman, The Golden Horn, 1-456

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>187</sup> Wakeman, The Mysterious Parchment, 32-86; 125-149; 172-174; 271-320

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>188</sup> Wakeman, *The Mysterious Parchment*, 1-321; Wakeman, *The Golden Horn*, 1-456

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>189</sup>Wakeman, The Mysterious Parchment, 1-21; 130-230

society. These things continued and in various ways grew as the century progressed.<sup>190</sup> But, the temperance movement also added additional stances and practices. Temperance activists increasingly grew to view the alcohol issue as a public and political issue, and to believe that collective persuasion and action could be used to help overcome social obstacles and advance temperance. This would lead an element of the temperance movement to support government restrictions on the alcohol industry, and eventually laws to prohibit the industry's activities.<sup>191</sup>

Prohibitionist thinking has had a notable presence since at least the 1830's. In the 1833 convention of the American Temperance Society, Gerrit Smith introduced a resolution condemning the liquor traffic.<sup>192</sup>

"Resolved, that in the opinion of this Convention, the traffic in ardent spirits, as a drink, is *morally wrong*; and that the inhabitants of cities, towns, and other local communities, should be permitted by law to prohibit the said traffic within their respective jurisdictions."<sup>193</sup>

This resolution opened debates in state and local temperance societies across the country. While it was highly contentious at the time, it helped open a discourse which allowed support for prohibitionism to increase.<sup>194</sup>

Support for prohibitionist policies in Western New York was further bolstered by a rising social consciousness on alcohol issues. Ideas drawn from reformism, religious revivalism, and early American republicanism helped to encourage the belief that the individual had the right to participate in shaping the course of their society.<sup>195</sup> Research into the collective social costs of alcohol helped to inform people of the costs they had to be pay from other people's drinking; whether that be in lost productivity, lost business, or paying taxes to deal with the poverty, crime,

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>190</sup> Second Annual Report of the New York State Society for the Promotion of Temperance, 13-85; Tyler, Freedom's Ferment, 322-350; New-York State Temperance Society. American quarterly temperance magazine. Vol. 1-2, 1-96
 <sup>191</sup> Tyler, Freedom's Ferment, 322-350

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>192</sup> Tyler, *Freedom's Ferment*, 328

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>193</sup> Tyler, Freedom's Ferment, 328

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>194</sup> Tyler, Freedom's Ferment, 322-350

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>195</sup> Cross, *The Burned Over District*, 1-53; 68-148; 187-321; Tyler, *Freedom's Ferment*, 5-85; 308-389; Flint, *An Address To the Buffalo Young Men's Temperance Society*, 1-18; Clinton, Address of George W. Clinton Delivered Before The Young Men's Temperance Society of Buffalo, March, 6<sup>th</sup>, 1841, 1-16; Clinton, *Address Delivered By George W. Clinton At the Dedication of Erie Tent No. 30, I.O. of R. Of The City Of Buffalo, Friday, October 24, 1845, 1-16; Walters, American Reformers 1815-1860*, 3-76; Irish, Manuscript of Speech delivered by James R. Irish on Jan 1, 1838, before the Alfred Total-Abstinence Society, 1-56; Wakeman, *The Mysterious Parchment*, 194-235; *The Common People: From Lincoln's Address at Springfield, Illinois, February 22, 1842* 

and death caused by drinking. This contributed to some people coming to support prohibition.<sup>196</sup> In *The Mysterious Parchment*, there is an instance of a farmer who had previously been indifferent to prohibitive policies, until a temperance activist informed him how much of his tax bill was going to cover the alcohol industry's social damage. He then became friendly toward temperance<sup>197</sup>. As temperance activists continued to run up against the alcohol industry more came to see the alcohol industry as having an interest in promoting and perpetuating drinking, regardless of the consequences it had for its customers or society at large. Consequently, some temperance advocates came to believe that if the people in the alcohol industry wouldn't voluntarily stop, that they should be made to stop so that they would no longer be able to harm people with their product.<sup>198</sup> These factors combined to raise the social consciousness of the public and convince various people that there was a legitimate public interest in creating laws to restrict and even prohibit the activities of the alcohol industry.

This support for legal restrictions and prohibitions began to become politically significant in the 1830's to 1850's. In the early 1830's, local governments, such as the city of Rochester, began to establish restrictions on who could sell alcohol and established licensing requirements. The standards and level of enforcement for these restrictions varied depending on the political climate at a given time.<sup>199</sup> Standards could be stricter or looser and enforcement could be greater or lesser, depending on which political faction was leading and at a given time. Generally, the Democratic Party tended to be friendlier to the alcohol industry, while Whigs tended to relatively more favorable towards greater restriction. Although there were acceptations to this.<sup>200</sup> By the

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>196</sup> Flint, An Address To the Buffalo Young Men's Temperance Society, 1-18; Clinton, Address of George W. Clinton Delivered Before The Young Men's Temperance Society of Buffalo, March, 6<sup>th</sup>, 1841, 1-16; Clinton, Address Delivered By George W. Clinton At the Dedication of Erie Tent No. 30, I.O. of R. Of The City Of Buffalo, Friday, October 24, 1845, 1-16; Dormer, Mr. Dormer's Address: Economic Aspects Of The Liquor Traffic, 1-15; Mohl, Poverty in New York, 1783-1825, 116-133; 211-225; Johnson, A Shopkeeper's Millennium, 55-61; 75-94; 121-133
 <sup>197</sup> Wakeman, The Mysterious Parchment, 253-268

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>198</sup> Freedom's Ferment, 322-350; Flint, An Address To the Buffalo Young Men's Temperance Society, 1-18; Clinton, Address of George W. Clinton Delivered Before The Young Men's Temperance Society of Buffalo, March, 6<sup>th</sup>, 1841, 1-16; Clinton, Address Delivered By George W. Clinton At the Dedication of Erie Tent No. 30, I.O. of R. Of The City Of Buffalo, Friday, October 24, 1845, 1-16; Walters, American Reformers 1815-1860, 123-144; Irish, Manuscript of Speech delivered by James R. Irish on Jan 1, 1838, before the Alfred Total-Abstinence Society, 1-56; Wakeman, The Mysterious Parchment, 108-321

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>199</sup>Johnson, A Shopkeeper's Millennium, 75-94; 121-133

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>200</sup> Johnson, A Shopkeeper's Millennium, 75-94; 121-133; Mulford, Pioneer Days and Later Times in Corning and the Vicinity, 100-286; Thomas P. Dimitroff, and Lois S. Janes, History of the Corning Painted Post Area: 200 Years in Painted Post Country, Revised Edition, (Corning: Bookmark, 1991), From, Steuben County Historical Society, 100-101

1840's some communities were establishing local prohibition, and the state of New York had moved to establish its own statewide licensing system.<sup>201</sup> Figures such as Gerrit Smith and Myron Clark promoted the creation of a statewide prohibition law. This effort gained strength entering into the 1850's, and was able to mount a serious attempt in the nation's first prohibitionist wave.<sup>202</sup>

#### The Maine Law and the First Prohibitionist Wave in the 1850's

In the 1850's, support for prohibition policies had risen as a significant political movement in New York and in other parts of the country.<sup>203</sup> By this time various communities had established local bans on alcohol and various states had somewhat restricted alcohol through licencing requirements established in the 1830's and 40's.<sup>204</sup> The first successful effort at a statewide prohibition law was in Maine. In 1851, Maine temperance activists, most notably Portland mayor Neal Dow, had persuaded the legislature to pass the Maine Law (aka the Maine Liquor Law). The Maine Law banned the sale of alcohol, with the exception of medical, mechanical, and manufacturing purposes.<sup>205</sup> Following its passage, the law inspired temperance activists to push heavily for statewide prohibition laws in other states. During the decade 12 states, including New York, passed similar laws. The Maine Law would remain in effect until it was repealed in 1856. And the laws passed in other states were struck down in courts or repealed by legislatures, within a decade.<sup>206</sup>

It was in this context that Joel Wakeman initially published his book, *The Mysterious Parchment: Or, The Satanic License.* Wakeman dedicated his book to advancing temperance and the promotion of the Maine Law.<sup>207</sup> The book was a temperance novel, which told the story of the fictional town of Harwood and the growing temperance movement arising as people grew

<sup>204</sup> Tyler, Freedom's Ferment, 327-350; Johnson, A Shopkeeper's Millennium, 75-94; 121-133

<sup>206</sup> Clubb, The *Maine liquor law*, 1-210

While the parties had their relative distinctions, there were individuals in them who differed from their party's norm. There were some Whigs who favored the alcohol industry, and some Democrats who were critical towards it.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>201</sup> Tyler, Freedom's Ferment, 327-350; Johnson, A Shopkeeper's Millennium, 75-94; 121-133; Haskett, A letter to the friends of temperance in the state of New York; Against Prohibition and for a license law based on pecuniary policy, 3-4

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>202</sup>Tyler, Freedom's Ferment, 327-350;

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>203</sup> Henry S. Clubb, *The Maine liquor law; its origin, history, and results, including a life of Hon. Neal Dow*, 1-210; Tyler, *Freedom's Ferment,* 327-350; Cross, *The Burned Over District,* 276

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>205</sup>Clubb, The *Maine liquor law*, 40-47; 90-151; 173-200

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>207</sup> Wakeman, The Mysterious Parchment, 1-6

more aware of the harms of alcohol and the alcohol industry. Eventually temperance activists came to see that the institutions which provided alcohol promoted and perpetuated alcohol use, that the financial interests of distributors would make them unlikely to voluntarily stop, and thus in the interest of public welfare the sale of alcohol would need to be banned.<sup>208</sup>

Wakeman's book can be considered to help illuminate aspects of the temperance movement in Western New York leading up to 1853. The book is set in Western New York in the early 1850's. It was reportedly inspired from Wakeman's own observations living in Western New York. It also appears to be consistent with multiple historical accounts.<sup>209</sup> It indicates that the mental transformation of individuals leading to support for the state prohibition law generally included the development of a belief that alcohol was by nature harmful and the solution was total abstinence, that the alcohol industry had a vested interest in promoting and perpetuating alcohol use, while leaving the public to pay the social costs, and that persuasion had limited effects in stopping distributors. From this it could be concluded that the public had a vested interest and that legal prohibition was needed to stop the alcohol industry.<sup>210</sup> It also helps to shed to some light on the likely tactics which were used to promote the New York prohibition law. It is likely that advocates did seek to promote it through house to house conversations and public meetings, and that they used arguments about public welfare and the tax burden involved in paying the social costs of drinking to seek to convince people to support the law and to pressure politicians to get behind it.<sup>211</sup> Furthermore, it also presented the elements of opposition to the law, which included unrepentant drinkers, alcohol distributors, hardline individualists, politicians with financial support from the alcohol industry, and lawyers who argued that the law was unconstitutional. Incidentally, this foreshadowed the vetoing of the first passage of the state prohibition law and it being struck down by the state court after it succeeded in becoming law.<sup>212</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>208</sup> Wakeman, *The Mysterious Parchment*, 108-321

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>209</sup> Wakeman, The Mysterious Parchment, 1-321; Haskett, A letter to the friends of temperance in the state of New York; Against Prohibition and for a license law based on pecuniary policy, 3-4; Tyler, Freedom's Ferment, 338-350; Clubb, The Maine liquor law, 1-210; Cross, The Burned Over District, 274

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>210</sup> Wakeman, *The Mysterious Parchment*, 1-321

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>211</sup> Wakeman, The Mysterious Parchment, 92-221
 <sup>212</sup> Wakeman, The Mysterious Parchment, 201-221; Haskett, A letter to the friends of temperance in the state of New York; Against Prohibition and for a license law based on pecuniary policy, 3-4; Clubb, The Maine liquor law, 81-82

In New York state, supporters of a state prohibition law grew into a significant political force by1854. That year, the state legislature passed a law to prohibit the sale of liquor. Democratic Governor Horatio Seymour vetoed it. In the following 1854 election, Seymour was replaced by the prohibition friendly Whig governor, Myron Clark. In 1855, Governor Clark signed the prohibition law, and it took effect in July of that year.<sup>213</sup> Shortly thereafter, opponents of the law took the State to court. The State Court of Appeals declared the law unconstitutional, based on the claim that it involved the taking of private property without due process of the law.<sup>214</sup>

Though the state's first attempt at statewide prohibition ended, the prohibition debate continued. By 1857, prohibitionists in the legislature had sought to establish a new state excise law to create additional restrictions. Prohibitionists regrouped in the following years and sought to create a stronger attempt to pass prohibition.<sup>215</sup> At the same time opponents of the temperance movement, supporters of the alcohol industry, and anti-prohibition temperance activists opposed them. For instance, in 1858, William Jay Haskett, anti-prohibition temperance supporter in New York City wrote an open letter arguing prohibitionist laws were unconstitutional and that temperance activity should focus only convincing individuals to voluntarily abandon their practices.<sup>216</sup> The temperance and prohibition movements would be temporarily held up by the American Civil War. Once the Civil War was over, temperance and prohibition supporters retooled their efforts and found new fertile ground for building support.<sup>217</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>213</sup> Clubb, The *Maine liquor law*, 81-82; Clubb, The *Maine liquor law*, 1-210

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>214</sup> Haskett, A letter to the friends of temperance in the state of New York; Against Prohibition and for a license law based on pecuniary policy, 3-4; The Jim Drake Stories, (Bath, Steuben County Bicentennial Commission, 1995), From, Steuben County Historical Society, 60

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>215</sup> Haskett, A letter to the friends of temperance in the state of New York; Against Prohibition and for a license law based on pecuniary policy, 3-7; Mattingly, Well Tempered Women, xiii-74; Walters, American Reformers 1815-1860, 137-143; James Shaw, History of the Great Temperance Reforms of the 19<sup>th</sup> Century, 141-161; 234-395
 <sup>216</sup> Haskett, A letter to the friends of temperance in the state of New York; Against Prohibition and for a license law based on pecuniary policy, 3-12

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>217</sup>Shaw, History of the Great Temperance Reforms of the 19<sup>th</sup> Century, 141-161; 234-395; Mattingly, Well Tempered Women, xiii-74; Lisa Anderson, The Politics of Prohibition: American Governance and the Prohibition Party,1869-1933, (New York: Cambridge University Press, 2013), 1-226

## The Development of Temperance and Prohibitionism in the Later 19<sup>th</sup> Century

By the later part of the 19<sup>th</sup> century teetotalism and prohibitionism had ascended as the dominant stances within the area's prohibition movement.<sup>218</sup> Support for prohibitionist policies also tended to increase following the American Civil War. The Civil War and the abolition of slavery ended up encouraging more people about the capacity to achieve social change though government policy, while also encouraging people to be more critical toward the idea that individual moral suasion was sufficient for achieving reform. More people became convinced that a combination of moral suasion and government policy was needed to defeat the alcohol industry.<sup>219</sup>

Local temperance activists moved forward in promoting the cause. Figures, such Peter Colgan, helped to expand the temperance movement within the catholic community.<sup>220</sup> In 1882, Joel Wakeman published *The Golden Horn: Or, The Fatal Exchange*.<sup>221</sup> Similar to *The Mysterious Parchment*, the book involved a fictional community where a temperance movement was present, and those involved in the alcohol industry placed their personal interests over public welfare. However, this book differed in that the anti-prohibitionists defeated the attempt to ban or dismantle the alcohol industry. While some temperate members of the town were fine, the town as a whole was placed in disarray. Many community members died or had their lives ruined, and some of the anti-prohibitionists in the end realized that they had made a mistake. Thus, this book acted as a more cautionary tale for his readers.<sup>222</sup>

In 1882, temperance supporters in and around the town of Cuba founded the Cuba Temperance Meeting Camp.<sup>223</sup> The site was used to host temperance lectures, meetings, and conventions. The meeting grounds was visited by prominent figures from throughout the country, including John P. St. John, Oliver W. Stewart, and Booker T. Washington. It effectively

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>218</sup> Freedom's Ferment, 308-350; Walters, American Reformers 1815-1860, 123-144; Mattingly, Well Tempered Women, xiii-74; Anderson, The Politics of Prohibition, 1-226

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>219</sup> Ginzberg, Women and the work of benevolence, 1-35; 68-81

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>220</sup> McNamara, A Century of Grace, 39-106; Mulford, Pioneer Days and Later Times in Corning and the Vicinity, 286; Millard F. Roberts, Historical Gazetteer: Steuben County, New York, (Syracuse: Millard F. Roberts, 1891), From, Steuben County Historical Society, 269-270

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>221</sup> Wakeman, *The Golden Horn,* 1-457; *Pioneer Days and Later Times in Corning and the Vicinity,* 283

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>222</sup> Wakeman, *The Golden Horn*, 1-457

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>223</sup> Minard, Allegany County and its People, 824

acted as an intellectual center for the area's temperance movement and for prohibitionist politics.<sup>224</sup>

In 1883, James Dormer contended that the liquor traffic was a burden on tax payers by increasing the costs of dealing with poverty, widows and orphans, and desolate properties.<sup>225</sup> In 1896, the New York State Legislature passed a law which required and set standards for public schools and state colleges to provide information on the effects of alcohol in health education and medical programs.<sup>226</sup>

The movement was bolstered by the rise of strong nation-wide prohibitionist organizations. This included the Prohibition Party, the Women's Christian Temperance Union, and the Anti Saloon League. The Prohibition Party was founded in 1869 by a group of reformists who had broken away from the Republic Party. The Prohibition Party's early stances included support for prohibition, women's suffrage, equal pay for women, civil rights, and ending child labor.<sup>227</sup> The Prohibition Party had a relatively significant presence in New York state by the 1880's and helped to support the prohibition movement on the political stage.<sup>228</sup> As mentioned, the Women's Christian Temperance Union was founded in 1873, and became a significant organization for promoting temperance culture and prohibition laws.<sup>229</sup> The Anti-Saloon League was founded in 1893. It operated primarily as a producer of prohibitionist printed material and as a lobbyist, encouraging officials to pass a constitutional amendment prohibiting the manufacture, distribution, and sale of alcohol.<sup>230</sup> These organizations were major forces involved with drawing

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>224</sup> Minard, Allegany County and its People, 824; 1895 Programme, The Cuba Temperance Society; Twentieth Annual Session: Cuba Temperance Society; Programme of the Twelfth Annual Temperance Camp Meeting At Cuba N. Y., Aug. 15 to 22, '93, Cuba: Cuba Temperance Society, 1893

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>225</sup> Dormer, Mr. Dormer's Address: Economic Aspects Of The Liquor Traffic, 1-15

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>226</sup> The Ainsworth School Physiology Law, With Amendments of 1896

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>227</sup> Anderson, *The Politics of Prohibition*, 1-98; Storms, *Partisan Prophets*, 1-23

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>228</sup> "1872 Prohibition Party Platform", Prohibitionists.org, Accessed April 10, 2017, <u>http://www.prohibitionists.org/background/party\_platform/Platform1872.htm</u>; Anderson, *The Politics of Prohibition*, 1-98; Storms, *Partisan Prophets*, 1-23

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>229</sup> Willard, *Glimpses of Fifty Years*, 330-394; Minard, *Allegany County and its People*, 199-203; Mattingly, *Well Tempered Women*, 39-74; 171-172; District Temperance Union Minutes, 1879-1880, 1-52; "Eighty One Women Started W.C.T.U. Here Sixty-Three Years Ago"

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>230</sup> "Anti-Saloon League Museum", Anti-Saloon League Museum | Westerville Public Library, Accessed April 20,
 2017, <u>http://www.westervillelibrary.org/AntiSaloon/</u>

together a diverse coalition of supporters to pass the 18<sup>th</sup> Amendment and establish national prohibition.<sup>231</sup>

By the 1880's, prohibitionists in the state began mounting significant efforts to support expanding local prohibition, and promote the passage of state and federal prohibition amendments. These activists, like others in the country, gradually grew as a political force; expanding the number of dry localities and building support for a national prohibition amendment.<sup>232</sup> This effort would continue to gain steam into the early 20<sup>th</sup> century, leading to the ratification of the 18<sup>th</sup> Amendment in 1920.<sup>233</sup>

# Understanding the Mental and Ethical Dynamics at Work in the Major Shifts in the Region's Temperance Movement

By analyzing this historical information, certain insights are gained about the general intellectual and ethical dynamics which were at work in the development of the temperance movement in the region.

The view of the nature of alcohol and its implications changed. A significant number of people began to consider the possible negative effects of alcohol use. Initially this regard had been largely focused on distilled alcohol and had tended to interpret the problems as a product of excess. But further consideration of the problems of alcohol gave rise to the ideas that the problems of alcohol were inherent to the nature of the substance, and came to regard more forms of alcohol as causing intoxication and intemperance. This led to the rise of teetotalism. Furthermore, the consideration of the harms of alcohol led to people regarding alcohol as a cause of sickness, poverty, neglect, crime, and death.

There was also a rise in the belief in an ethical obligation to combat alcohol. Considerations of the mental harm and negative behaviors caused by alcohol encouraged the belief that alcohol was destructive to both humanity and the moral condition of things. This, combined with the belief that an individual has a moral obligation to look out for the wellbeing

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>231</sup> Anderson, *The Politics of Prohibition*, 1-226; Storms, *Partisan Prophets*, 1-38

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>232</sup> Minard, Allegany County and its People, 824; 1895 Programme, The Cuba Temperance Society; Twentieth Annual Session: Cuba Temperance Society; Programme of the Twelfth Annual Temperance Camp Meeting At Cuba N. Y., Aug. 15 to 22, '93, Cuba: Cuba Temperance Society, 1893; Dimitroff and Janes, History of the Corning Painted Post Area: 200 Years in Painted Post Country

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>233</sup> Anderson, *The Politics of Prohibition*, 1-226; Storms, *Partisan Prophets*, 1-38

of people and promote moral improvement, led to the conclusion that one has a moral obligation to work to eliminate intemperance.

The reformist climate of 19<sup>th</sup> Century New York helped to further this. The notion that people and society can to a great degree be reformed to improve their conditions, contributed to people being increasingly confident that they could advance temperance.

The views toward those producing and distributing alcohol also changed. People increasingly came to regard the alcohol industry as a promoter and perpetuator of alcohol consumption, for its own interests. This encouraged the belief that the alcohol industry needed to be dismantled in order to help reform drinkers.

After alcohol was connected to certain negative effects, there was a tendency to then look into the collective impact of those activities and quantify them. When this occurred, it served to expand public awareness of the social costs of alcohol, and thus encourage them to think of it more as a public issue. The issue of the alcohol industry and understanding the social costs of alcohol helped to encourage people to believe that they had a public interest in combating the use of alcohol.

Ideas of collective moral responsibility and the obligation of democratic government to serve the public welfare helped to form a basis for contending that alcohol was a public issue, which the government had a legitimate justification to legislate on.

These ideas about the nature of alcohol and the alcohol industry, the ethical obligations of people individually and collectively, and the legitimacy of the community to legislate for the public interest and welfare, helped give rise to prohibitionism.

### Conclusion

The temperance movement developed in Western New York over the course of the 19<sup>th</sup> century from a small element of people calling for moderation in drinking to a large movement, largely embracing total abstinence and prohibition, aiming to transform American society's cultural and political treatment of alcohol. It is here stated that these shifts had occurred in large part due to the changes in people's ideas toward the nature of alcohol, ethical responsibilities, individual and collective responsibility, and the interests of the public. As people increasingly

44

came to view alcohol is inherently harmful in all forms and came to believe that they had an ethical obligation to combat such harms, teetotalism grew to be more popular. As reformist ideas promoted the possibility of morally reforming people and society, the temperance movement gained enthusiasm. As people came to regard the alcohol industry as a propagator of intemperance, became aware of the social costs of alcohol, and came to see personal welfare as a public interest, prohibitionism became more popular. These shifts in thinking came about in the active mental lives of numerous people. The behavior of those who undertook to promote these ideas and practices produced forces which helped to shape the direction of society and advance the temperance movement. These dynamics were connected with the historical events and influences mentioned in this account, establishing a symbiotic relationship. By drawing upon their intellectual development and approaching their situations, the supporters of temperance were able to work within historical forces to produce the significant developments and qualitative shifts with occurred with the temperance movement in 19<sup>th</sup> century Western New York.

### **Bibliography**

- "1872 Prohibition Party Platform." Prohibitionists.org. Accessed March 21, 2017. http://www.prohibitionists.org/background/party\_platform/Platform1872.htm.
- Alfred Historical Society and Baker's Bridge Association. *History of Alfred, New York*. Dallas, Texas: Curtis Media Corporation, 1990.
- Alfred Yearbook 1903-1904. Alfred, New York: Alfred University, 1904.
- Allen, Abigale. Life and Sermons of Jonathan Allen, Ph.D., D.D., LL.D., President of Alfred University. Alfred: Published By Subscription, 1894.
- Anderson, Lisa. "Give the Ladies a Chance: Gender and Partisanship in the Prohibition Party, 1869–1912". *Journal of Women's History* 2: 137-161
- Anderson, Lisa. *The Politics of Prohibition: American Governance and the Prohibition Party*, 1869-1933. New York: Cambridge University Press, 2013.
- "Anti-Saloon League Museum." Anti-Saloon League Museum | Westerville Public Library. Accessed April 20, 2017. <u>http://www.westervillelibrary.org/AntiSaloon/</u>.
- Bloomer, D.C. Life and Writings of Amelia Bloomer; With A New Introduction by Susan J. Kleinberg. 1895. Reprint, New York: Shocken Books, 1975.
- Brown, Eli F. Youth's temperance manual: an elementary physiology : prepared with special reference to the nature of alcoholic drinks and narcotics, and their effects upon the human system, and in accordance with the requirements of the Woman's Christian Temperance Union. New York: American Book Co, 1888.
- Calderwood, W.G. *Temperance Facts*, (Minneapolis: Minnesota Temperance Movement, 1940. <u>https://babel.hathitrust.org/cgi/pt?id=mdp.39015071420817;view=1up;seq=2</u>
- Certificate of Membership Pledge for the Sons of Temperance Organization Division Leicester No. 80, Signed by S.S. Westlake, November 25<sup>th</sup> 1851. Westlake FF-B3-904. Family Files Original Series, Box 3, Folder 71. Livingston County Historian's office. Mt. Morris, New York.
- Clark, Martin Marion. Martin Marion Clark to Eslie Langworthy. Letter. June 7, 1870. V-File: Alfred Area History: letters. Alfred University Archives, Herrick Library.
- Clinton, George W. Address Delivered By George W. Clinton At the Dedication of Erie Tent No. 30, I.O. of R. Of The City Of Buffalo, Friday, October 24, 1845. Buffalo: Press of C.E. Young, 1845. HV5295.C541845C.2. 'Breweries, Temperance & Prohibition in Buffalo, NY' collection. Buffalo and Erie County Historical Society Library.
- Clinton, George W. Esq. Address of George W. Clinton Delivered Before The Young Men's Temperance Society of Buffalo, March, 6<sup>th</sup>, 1841. Buffalo: Frenchett and Scheffer, 1841. HV5295.C541841c.2. 'Breweries, Temperance & Prohibition in Buffalo, NY' collection. Buffalo and Erie County Historical Society Library.

- Clubb, Henry S. *The Maine liquor law; its origin, history, and results, including a life of Hon. Neal Dow.* New York: Pub. for the Maine Law Statistical Society, by Fowler and Wells, 1856. <u>https://babel.hathitrust.org/cgi/pt?id=uc2.ark:/13960/t3fx76t0v</u>
- Cole, Asahel N. Cole's Combined System of Drainage and Irrigation; "A New System of Agriculture". Ed. A.P Cole. Wellsville: 1889. http://babel.hathitrust.org/cgi/pt?id=pst.000005415595;view=1up;seq=12
- Cole, Asahel N. *The New Agriculture; or, the Waters Held Captive*. New York: The American Angler, William C. Harris and H. H. Thomson, 1885. <u>https://babel.hathitrust.org/cgi/pt?id=uc2.ark:/13960/t0vq2vt52;view=1up;seq=122</u>
- Collection of Women's Christian Temperance Union of Livingston County Meeting Programs, 1887-1903. Livingston County Historian's office. Mt. Morris, New York.
- Cross, Whitney. The Burned Over District: The social and Intellectual History of Enthusiastic Religion in Western New York, 1800-1850. Ithaca: Cornell University press, 1950.
- Declaration of Principles, Written by Frances E. Willard. n.d. Livingston County Historian's office. Mt. Morris, New York.
- Dimitroff, Thomas P. and Lois S. Janes. *History of the Corning Painted Post Area: 200 Years in Painted Post Country*. Revised Edition. Corning: Bookmark, 1991. From, Steuben County Historical Society.
- District Temperance Union Minutes, 1879-1880. Livingston County Historian's office. Mt. Morris, New York.
- Douglas, Harry S. "PIONEER EXPERIENCES IN WESTERN NEW YORK" New York History Vol. 32, No. 3 (July, 1951), pp. 259-274. JSTOR. Accessed April 25, 2016 http://www.jstor.org/stable/23149916
- Dormer, James. *Mr. Dormer's Address: Economic Aspects Of The Liquor Traffic.* HV742.N7D47. Rare Collection, 'Breweries, Temperance & Prohibition in Buffalo, NY' collection. Buffalo and Erie County Historical Society Library.
- *Elizabeth Cady Stanton, Susan B. Anthony; Correspondence, Writings, Speeches.* Edited with a critical commentary by Ellen Carol DuBois, Forward by Gerda Lerner. New York: Shocken Books, 1981.
- Flint, Austin. M.D. An Address To the Buffalo Young Men's Temperance Society, Thursday Evening April 1, 1841, By Austin Flint M. D., To Which Are Added The Constitution Of The Society, and A List Of The Members. Buffalo: Press of Thomas and Co, 1841. HV 5298.B83F41841. 'Breweries, Temperance & Prohibition in Buffalo, NY' collection. Buffalo and Erie County Historical Society Library.
- Frederick Douglas Papers. Underground Railroad Collection. Allegany County Historian's Office. Belmont. New York.

- Fronczak, F.E. Alcoholism- A Crime or a Disease. Buffalo: Buffalo Medical Society, February 1901. In 'Breweries, Temperance & Prohibition in Buffalo, NY' collection. Buffalo and Erie County Historical Society Library.
- Ginsberg, Judah B. "Barnburners, Free Soilers, and the New York Republican Party". *New York History* 57 (4) (1976). New York State Historical Association. http://www.jstor.org/stable/23169428
- Ginzberg, Lori D. Women and the work of benevolence: Morality, politics, and class in the nineteenth-century united states. New Haven: Yale University Press, 1990.
- Haskett, William Jay. A letter to the friends of temperance in the state of New York; Against Prohibition and for a license law based on pecuniary policy. New York: J.D. Torrey, 1858. https://babel.hathitrust.org/cgi/pt?id=uc2.ark:/13960/t6vx08r72;view=1up;seq=3
- Hine, Thomas. *The Rise and Fall of the American Teenager: A New History of the Adolescent Experience*. New York: Harper Collins, 1999.
- Hitchcock, Edward. An argument for early temperance; addressed to the youth of the United States. By Edward Hitchcock...Altered and enl. from his prize essay on temperance. Boston: Whipple and Damrell, 1837.
- Herries, William. PhD. *The Temperance Pledge Violated by the New York Carson League*. New York: A. Ranney, 1855. <u>https://babel.hathitrust.org/cgi/pt?id=hvd.32044088977764;view=1up;seq=5</u>
- Holmes, S.L. *Address on the Temperance Pledge*. Albany: Carol and Cook, 1843. <u>https://babel.hathitrust.org/cgi/pt?id=hvd.hwissn;view=1up;seq=8</u>
- Irish, James R. Manuscript of Speech delivered by James R. Irish on Jan 1, 1838, before the Alfred Total-Abstinence Society. Alfred, 1838. Alfred University Archives, Herrick Library.
- Johnson, Paul E. A Shopkeeper's Millennium; Society and Revivals in Rochester New York, 1815-1837. New York: Hill and Wang, 2004.
- Lakeville Temperance Society Minute Book, 1828-1840. Livingston County Historian's office. Mt. Morris, New York.
- Lerner, Gerda. *The Grimké Sisters from South Carolina : Pioneers for Women's Rights and Abolition* (2). Chapel Hill, US: The University of North Carolina Press, 2009. Accessed December 26, 2016. ProQuest ebrary. http://site.ebrary.com/lib/herr/detail.action?docID=10355400
- Mattingly, Carol *Well Tempered Women; Nineteenth Century Temperance Rhetoric*. Carbondale: Southern Illinois University Press, 1998.
- McNamara, Robert F. A Century of Grace: The History of St. Mary's Roman Catholic Parish Corning, N.Y. 1848-1948. Second Edition. Corning: St. Mary's Church, 1979.

- Minard, John S. Allegany County and its People; A Centennial Memorial History of Allegany County New York. Alfred New York: University Press, Sun Publishing Association, 1896. http://babel.hathitrust.org/cgi/pt?id=loc.ark:/13960/t55d8zx2j;view=1up;seq=853
- "Minutes of the Seventh-Day Baptist General Conference, Held at Alfred N.Y. September, 1836" *Seventh Day Baptist Year Books 1808-1844*. Alfred: Alfred College Library.
- Mohl, Raymond A. Poverty in New York, 1783-1825. New York: Oxford University Press, 1971.
- Mulford, Uri. *Pioneer Days and Later Times in Corning and the Vicinity*. Corning, New York: Uri Mulford, N. d. <u>https://archive.org/stream/cu31924028823783#page/n3/mode/2up</u>
- Neumann, Caryn E. Woman's New York state temperance society. *Encyclopedia of New York State*: 2005. Gale Group. Accessed October 6, 2016. <u>http://go.galegroup.com/ps/i.do?p=AONE&u=suny\_ceramics&id=GALE|A194199194&</u> <u>v=2.1&it=r&sid=summon&userGroup=suny\_ceramics&authCount=1</u>
- New-York State Temperance Society. *American quarterly temperance magazine. Vol. 1-2.* Albany: Executive committee of the N.Y.S. temperance society, 1833-34. <u>https://babel.hathitrust.org/cgi/pt?id=umn.31951001891524s;view=1up;seq=4</u>
- New York State Temperance Society. *The Temperance Almanac No. 8, For the Year of Our Lord 1841.* Utica: G.R. Perkins, 1841. https://babel.hathitrust.org/cgi/pt?id=hvd.32044105551097;view=1up;seq=2
- New York State Temperance Society. *The Temperance Almanac For the Year of Our Lord 1845*. Troy: Executive Committee of the New York State Temperance Society, B.H. Boynton, 1845. <u>https://babel.hathitrust.org/cgi/pt?id=umn.31951002261725y;view=1up;seq=3</u>
- Norwood, John Nelson. *Fiat Lux; The Story of Alfred University*. Alfred, New York: Alfred University, 1957.
- Phelan, Helene C. Allegany's Uncommon Folk. Alfred: Sun Publishing Company, 1978.
- Phelan, Helene C. And Why Not Every Man. Interlaken: Heart of the Lakes Publishing, 1987.
- Phelan, Helene C. IF Our Earthly Dissolve; A Story of the Wetherby- Hagadorn Family of Almond New York, Told From Their Diaries and Papers. Alfred: Sun Publishing Company, 1973.
- Pledge Of The Land Of Hope. Pledge by Members of the Sabbath School at Alfred Centre. 1877. Alfred University Archives. Alfred, New York.
- Programme of the Twelfth Annual Temperance Camp Meeting At Cuba N. Y., Aug. 15 to 22, '93. Cuba: Cuba Temperance Society, 1893.
- "Rev. Hiram Burdick; This Pioneer Physician and Clergyman Died at His Home on Hartsville Hill". Alfred Sun. April 6, 1904. Alfred University Archives.
- Roberts, Millard F. *Historical Gazetteer: Steuben County, New York.* Syracuse: Millard F. Roberts, 1891. From, Steuben County Historical Society.

- Rush, Benjamin. An Inquiry into the Effects of Ardent Spirits on the Human Mind and Body. 8th ed. Boston: James Loring, 1823. https://babel.hathitrust.org/cgi/pt?id=hvd.hn8np3;view=1up;seq=6
- Second Annual Report of the New York State Society for the Promotion of Temperance. Presented by the State Committee January 18<sup>th</sup> 1831. Albany: Packard and Van Benthuysen, 1831.

https://babel.hathitrust.org/cgi/pt?id=umn.31951d001531673;view=1up;seq=5

- Shaw, James. *History of the Great Temperance Reforms of the 19<sup>th</sup> Century*. Cincinnati: Walden and Stowe, 1917. <u>https://books.google.com/books?id=sypLAQAAMAAJ&printsec=frontcover&dq=books</u> <u>+on+the+history+of+19th+century+american+temperance&hl=en&sa=X&ved=0ahUKE</u> wiNy772i8HNAhXG0h4KHdWtCWA4ChDoAQgzMAM#v=onepage&q=books%20on
  - %20the%20history%20of%2019th%20century%20american%20temperance&f=false
- Shew, Joel. Hydropathy; or, The water cure: its principles, modes of treatment. New York: Wiley & Putnam, 1844. https://babel.hathitrust.org/cgi/pt?id=hvd.hn1v37;view=1up;seq=19

Sons of Temperance of North America. *Journal of proceedings of the National Division of the Sons of Temperance of North America Vol. 1.* Philadelphia: Jos. Severns & Co., 1844. https://babel.hathitrust.org/cgi/pt/search?q1=pledge;id=iau.31858034301840;view=1up;seq=1;st art=21;sz=10;page=search;orient=0

- St. Clair Champlin, Eva and Frances Babcock. An Offering to the Memory of Abigail Allen, by the Literary Societies of Alfred University. Alfred, New York: Sun Publishing Association, 1903.
- Storms, Roger. *Partisan Prophets; A History of the Prohibition Party*. Denver, Colorado: National Prohibition Foundation Inc., 1972.
- Strong, Susan Rumsey. "The Most Natural Way in the World; Coeducation at Nineteenth Century Alfred University". Ph.D. Thesis, Margaret Warner Graduate School of Education and Human Development, University of Rochester, Rochester, New York, 1995.
- Strong, Susan Rumsey. *Thought Know No Sex; Women's Rights at Alfred University*. Albany: State University of New York Press, 2008.
- "Temperance Worker." National Susan B. Anthony Museum and House Website. Accessed October 05, 2016. <u>http://susanbanthonyhouse.org/her-story/temp-worker.php</u>.
- Alfred Temperance Pledges. Temperance Collection. Alfred University Archives. Alfred, New York.
- The Ainsworth School Physiology Law, With Amendments of 1896. Livingston County Historian's office. Mt. Morris, New York.
- *The Common People: From Lincoln's Address at Springfield, Illinois, February 22, 1842.* New York City: W.C.T.U. Livingston County Historian's office. Mt. Morris, New York.

- *The Cuba Temperance Assembly August 13 To 19, 1895 Programme.* The Cuba Temperance Society. In The Temperance and Cuba Meeting Grounds Collection. Cuba Historical Society. Cuba, New York.
- *The Jim Drake Stories*. Bath, Steuben County Bicentennial Commission, 1995. From, Steuben County Historical Society.
- "The Lily: A Temperance and Abolitionist Newspaper." Accessible Archives Inc. Accessed March 18, 2017. http://www.accessible-archives.com/collections/the-lily/.
- The Union Signal. Frances E. Willard Centenary Issue. September 28, 1939. Vol. 45. No. 37.
- Turner, O. History of the Pioneer Settlement of the Phelps and Gorham Purchase and Morris Reserve. 1851. Reprint, Geneseo: James Brunner, 1976.
- Turner, O. *Pioneer History of the Holland Land Purchase of Western New York*. Buffalo: Jewitt, Thomas and Co., Geo. H. Derby and Co., 1849.
- Tyler, Alice Felt. *Freedom's Ferment Phases of American Social History to 1860.* Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1944.
- *Twentieth Annual Session: Cuba Temperance Society.* Cuba: Cuba Temperance Society, 1881. Temperance and Cuba Meeting Grounds Collection. Cuba Historical Society.
- Van Dorn Collection, C. 1832-1881. Livingston County Historian's Office, Mt. Morris New York.
- *Vinegar Bitters 1874 Almanac.* San Francisco: R.H. McDonald and Co., Druggists and General Agents, 1874. Livingston County Historian's Office. Mt. Morris, New York.
- Wakeman, Joel. *The Mysterious Parchment: Or, The Satanic License, Dedicated to Maine Law Progress.* Boston: John P. Jewett and Company, 1853. https://babel.hathitrust.org/cgi/pt?id=hvd.32044088987623;view=1up;seq=11
- Wakeman, Joel. *The Golden Horn, or the Fatal Exchange*. Lewisburg: S.T. Buck Son and Co., 1882.
- Walters, Ronald G. American Reformers 1815-1860. New York: Hill and Wang, 1984.
- Willard, Frances Elizabeth. *Glimpses of Fifty Years, the Autobiography of an American Woman.* Chicago: Women's Temperance Publication Association, H.J. Smith & Co., 1889. <u>https://babel.hathitrust.org/cgi/pt?id=mdp.39015009382931;view=1up;seq=11</u>
- Willard, Louise B. "Eighty One Women Started W.C.T.U. Here Sixty-Three Years Ago". The Livingston Republican. Cent Ed. P9. 19. Sept 23, 1937.
- Women's Christian Temperance Union of Livingston County New York Constitution and By-Laws. Livingston County Historian's office. Mt. Morris, New York.
- "Woman's New York State Temperance Society." Alcohol Problems and Solutions.org. Accessed October 5, 2016. <u>http://www.alcoholproblemsandsolutions.org/womans-new-york-state-temperance-society/</u>.

Young, Andrew. *History of Chautauqua County New York; From its First Settlement to the Present Time*. Buffalo: Mathews and Warren, 1875. <u>https://archive.org/stream/cu31924078391814/cu31924078391814\_djvu.txt</u>