

A Thesis Presented to
The Faculty of Alfred University

The Darker the Skin, The Harder the Road: An Examination of India's and Brazil's
Education Systems for Dalits and Pardos/Pretos

by

Kelsey I. Oliveira

In Partial Fulfillment of
the Requirements for
The Alfred University Honors Program

April 27th, 2018

Under the Supervision of:

Chair:

Dr. Jeff Sluyter-Beltrao

Committee Members:

Dr. Robert Myers

Dr. Robyn Goodman

EDGE: Education Global Equality

Life is a game. It's a phrase commonly used by many to describe the struggles individuals interact with in order to succeed. The problem with the analogy is that it is implied that all participants in the game are playing with all the same pieces. To counteract this Taylor Jaczko and I decided to put real life into a game. It begins with the realization that education is lacking. One of the most important parts of societies today is learning. Education is crucial to a well-functioning society yet over 70 million children do not receive education. There are a variety of ranging issues that include how flexible the system is, the treatment of students, and the factors of socioeconomic status in society. Each variable can play into the improvement or diminishment of a child's education.

The EDGE game puts these variables and factors into the individual's opportunity to play the game. To begin, each player picks a pawn, either red, blue, or yellow, and places it at the starting point. Each colored pawn correlates with a color card in which the player is required to draw from consistently. No player should pick from another colored set. In order to decide who goes first, the youngest member of the group will draw first and then so forth.

Following the set-up, the players can begin the game by repeatedly pulling a card from their deck and following the instructions. Along the way it is possible players could land on either a pencil or a student. If one lands on a pencil, one must choose from the deck with the pencil image. In this deck there are facts about education around the world such as, if a mother can read, a child is 50% more likely to survive past the age of 5. If a player lands on the image of a student, they must pull from the deck with the student image that discusses different stories. For instance, Wadley is a 7 year old girl who experiences Haiti's devastating earthquake which took away her home and school. Players have the opportunity to learn about some of her

obstacles and how she has overcome these in order to obtain education. The point of these two cards was for the players to not only play but learn about broad and individual perspectives on education.

The intention of this game is for players to grasp some of the inequalities within the educational systems around the world. It is hoped that players will walk away with a more informed understanding of injustices and the importance of education. The process of designing the game came about with how to create an interaction of different level of privileges while learning about the different situations around the world. Using the candyland style, individuals were able to advance, move back, or remain in the same spot. Those who picked up the red card were disadvantaged individuals who never left the starting point. Yellow pawns were considered neutrals who were able to move back and forth but did not advance much. The individual with the blue pawn constantly moves forward with nothing setting it back.

During the conference three different groups of three or four had the opportunity to play the game. Their reactions were crucial for understanding the impact. One group had begun an intense discussion on inequalities in education. Some had expressed their concerns for how the educational system affected them and their friends and if there were solutions that would accommodate to their needs. The second group which contained a black woman, a Hispanic woman, and a white man, expressed clear shock from the beginning of the game. Quickly grasping the process, each had realized they had been given another take on life that they were personally not accustomed to. The last group had chosen not to finish the game due to their frustration. Once they had caught on, one individual did not want to play any longer understanding that there was no way they were going to win. All groups expressed common

phrases such as, 'It is not fair!' or 'Can we switch?' These phrases and responses are important to understand the effect of our game.

Some of the individuals were thrown into a role they had not chosen and it frustrated them that they couldn't compete with their counterparts. We had wanted individuals to feel upset because it was then that they would be getting a small scaled experience of inequality completely based off nothing, which is what many children around the world face on a daily basis. While the game can really only be played once by participants, it is what they learn in the first game that truly stands out. Before people had the chance to play the game though, there were three sessions. The first began with Taylor's and my presentation of our research. With a brief discussion of our work, the conference quickly went into the first session. While we had originally decided to have two separate presenters in the first session, we decided to shorten both presenters work in order to allow attendees to listen to both.

Shakima Clency kicked off the first session discussing diversity in higher education. Following this was Angelica Gomez, who talked about "El Sistema", a music program designed for at risk youth in Venezuela in order to help them and continue their education. After a small break the conference resumed with the next session which included two speakers. Samara Zihettis, a recent Brazilian migrant to the US who is still learning English, talked briefly about the education system in Brazil. Attendees got a small glimpse and feedback on her personal experience about what education is typically like. Lastly, Dr. Stein presented on one of the basic problems of American education systems: how they seek to create employees rather than independent thinkers, and thus lend a hand to the inequality within the education system.

After reviewing the feedback it was clear the conference was impactful. One comment on our evaluation sheet stated, "I think each one had interesting components that engaged me in a

different way.” The diversity within the conference from speakers to activities pushed attendees to think further in ways they had never considered. That component was clearly crucial because it was understood that our research would not be read by many and as activists and educators we felt it was necessary to bring this to life. Individuals all walked away with a smaller version of the larger game that had been originally set up. This was to ensure that the message can continue to be spread and hope that others who engage with the game come across that learning moment that the game seeks to provide. Already the game has achieved this in large ways by professors’ eagerness to use the game in their classroom.

The experience overall was one of enlightenment and tribulations. There had been downfalls throughout the project such as lack of communication with people or struggles to find the right presenters. However, they did not stop the learning process that occurred for us both. It was an opportunity to expand on my teamwork skills as well as learn about organizing large events. In addition, I began to learn further in depth of the different inequalities that linger in education. Branching out in my studies to Brazil was one of the most exciting portions, as it gave me a deeper glimpse of inequalities in Latin America.

Following this paper is the rest of my research on educational inequalities for darker skinned individuals in India and Brazil.

The Darker the Skin, The Harder the Road: The Examination of India and Brazil's
Education System for Dalits and Pardo/Preto

“Education is neither Eastern nor Western, it is human.” Malala Yousafzai recognized that education is a universal necessity to improve every individual's life, every community, and every nation. However, it seems that countries have continuously found a way to create disparities. Educational anthropologists have argued that schools are playing effective roles in propagating social inequality. One such anthropologist, Pierre Bourdieu, argues that cultural capital (forms of knowledge) of the dominant group creates and cultivates social hierarchies.¹ The dominant group can only maintain power through enforcement of their ideals by institutions with abilities to influence without conflict. Schools thus become agitators of social inequality as they teach cultural capital of the dominant group as truth. Schools as agitators of social inequality is an important concept to keep in mind as it calls for a constant examination of current systems in order to prevent the deepening of social inequality. In India, their dominant group socially enforces discrimination against Dalits meanwhile Brazil traditionally oppresses its nonwhites, commonly referred to as pardos and pretos. To understand the discrimination within education for these two groups, first I will discuss how these two countries connect followed by a brief history of their education systems. Then both India and Brazil will be examined by three categories of disparities in order to further grasp the various inequalities in education.

Define Caste

So how did these inequalities begin? Or better yet how did hierarchies in these two countries come to be and how are they connected? It begins with the word *casta*. *Casta* originated in the Iberian Peninsula in order to distinguish “pure” blood from mixed in religion,

¹ Pierre Bourdieu, “The forms of capital,” *Handbook of Theory and Research for the Sociology of Education*, ed. J. Richardson (1986): 46-51.

primarily Christians from Jews and eventually Muslims. The term itself is traditionally referred to as caste and most commonly associated with India to define social categories. However, India used the word *varna* to describe the different groups which were mainly defined by religion. Orientalist and sociologist scholars such as Marx and Weber who have examined the word *casta*, recognize that it became another word to distinguish social class in a hierarchical way imposed by Western ideologies.² In India, the various and chaotic hierarchies were bound by religion, but it was the Portuguese/British/European domination that helped define the social stratification through colorism.

In colonial Latin America, *sistemas de casta*, were common to classify individuals according to their race based on the degree of African, European, or Indian descent. The Brazilian Institute of Geography and Statistics, created in 1936, was a Brazilian census agency that uses a system of ethnic/skin color categories in order to divide the population. Categories include *Branços* (whites), *Pretos* (blacks), *Amarelos* (asians), *Indígena* (Indigenous), and *Pardos* (multiracial). Most significantly the term *Pardos* is crucial for it was also a *casta* classification used during the colonization period. *Casta* classifications were expected to heighten social classes that came from the recognition of European ancestry.³ Throughout this comparative study it will be a common theme to see racial labeling as a key determinant factor in education. To get a glimpse of this, in a 1976 Brazilian census there were over 130 racial terms used to identify color category. While terminology is not as wide as once was, it still plays a crucial role when used to identify their race.

² Ângela Barreto Xavier, "Languages of Difference in the Portuguese Empire. The Spread of "Caste" in the Indian World," *Anuario Colombiano De Historia Social y De La Cultura* (2016): 93-96.

³ Bruce A. Castleman, "Social Climbers in a Colonial Mexican City: Individual Mobility within the Sistema de Castas in Orizaba, 1777-1791," *Colonial Latin American Review*, (2001).

Casta has different meanings between the two countries with the common thread of whiteness. It is an honor in Brazil to have light skin as it means one came from European descent, meanwhile, the lighter skin meant more purity in India, an idea shaped by colonist beliefs. While there is no concrete link on the etymology of caste in India and Brazil nor is this research based on this connection, scholars have recognized that the concept of social hierarchy based on skin color is affirmative in both cultures and has most likely been strongly shaped and encouraged by Portuguese/European domination.

However, it is important to keep in mind that there are many scholars who contest race as a factor of inequality in both Brazil and India. The thesis of Pierson argues that racial inequalities are actually class inequalities in Brazil. Meanwhile in India, some scholars articulate that the complexity of caste in combination with high nationalistic and anti-colonialist sentiments actually prevent white being the superior race in every instance.

History of India's Education

In 2010, India put into effect the RTE Act which explicitly stated that Children between the age groups of 6 and 14 can receive free and compulsory education.⁴ While it is an important stepping stone for education there are many still unanswered questions. Why are there large portions of children not completing school? Why is India's illiteracy rate so high? These questions consistently proposed examine social, political, and economic effects of the existing caste system on India's society. However a deeper examination of India's education system demonstrates how it has been heavily shifted, influenced, and modulated by religion, colonialism, and globalization.

⁴ "Right to Education," *Ministry of Human Resource Development Government of India*, (2016).

Originally only males in the Brahmin caste were allowed to receive a formal education while others learned their responsibilities from their parents and household. This was due to the caste system that separated people into four categories, the Brahmins, the Kshatriyas, the Vaishyas, and the Shudras. The fifth category was implied as those outside the system who were labeled as untouchables. Born into a group, people were not allowed to marry outside of their caste nor associate with lower castes. In addition to preventing mobility, each was given a profession in which their purity was based off. Untouchables are the lowest caste containing scheduled caste (SC), scheduled tribes (ST), and other backward caste (OBC). Later named the Dalits, untouchables gained their name through their duties of menial and service jobs because of their impurity.⁵ As a result, education was denied to this backward caste.

While education became offered freely, each caste began to receive education centered on their professions. For instance, males of the warrior class, Kshatriya, were taught to fight and the tactics of warfare while the Vaishyas learned about business. In the late Middle Ages, India experienced a heavy influence of Islam which caused access to education for all upper caste men, a shift in methods of education as well as an increase in a variety of topics including sciences and mathematics.⁶ Religious teachings, popularly Hindu ideology, was no longer heavily intertwined with their education but now varied in subjects.

When India finally gained independence from British rule, their constitution included Article 17 which banned discrimination against caste in order to eliminate caste inequalities. Schools continued to grow with new religious influences by the increase in numbers of Catholic

⁵ Chandra Pal Singh Chauhan, "Education and caste in India," *Asia Pacific Journal of Education* 28, 3 (2008): 217-218.

⁶ M. Gail Hickey and Mary Stratton, "Schooling in India: Effects of Gender and Caste," *scholarlypartnersedu* 2,1 (2007):68.

schools and English becoming the language of most schools.⁷ Although India still had a large illiterate population, uniformed primary schools were developed, along with a larger access to education for local communities which still continued to deny access to lower caste. Then in 1976, India's federal government gained control over curriculum and policies that demanded eight years of primary schooling plus two in secondary before taking entry exams to receive higher education.⁸ This began an attempt to create free and compulsory education acts throughout all of India, influenced by Western ideology.

History of Brazil's Education

In a brief history of Brazil's education system, the Company of Jesuits established the presence of formal education in Salvador, Bahia state, where the first elementary schools was founded in 1549. For 210 years, education was run and dominated with religious purpose by the Jesuits onto the indigenous people of Brazil. While Marquis of Pombal, King José I's of Portugal minister, separated education and church, it was King João VI's creation of more schools, scientific institutions, professional training, and public libraries. Educational work started a period of undeniable achievements for education.⁹ It is important to keep in mind though while developing education, the Portuguese were importing over 3.6 million African slaves. The 1888 law that banned slavery did not prevent the Portuguese from promoting miscegenation as well as encouraging white immigrants in order to maintain presence and thus power in various regions.

Each level of education has a unique history though. For the University level it took almost 30 years since its foundation for schools to incorporate graduate programs which

⁷ Hickey and Mary Stratton, "Schooling in India: Effects of Gender and Caste," 69.

⁸ Hickey and Mary Stratton, "Schooling in India: Effects of Gender and Caste," 69.

⁹ "Brazil-History & Background." StateUniversity.com

emphasized more academic research. Various actions taken by the government in regard to education have primarily focused on higher education, which has led to an uneven system. At the primary school level, the Constitution written in 1824 granted free elementary education to all citizens but the Additional Act in 1834 decentralized the education system which allowed provinces to manage education.¹⁰ The Brazilian Basic Law on Education (LDB) dispersed responsibility by placing higher education under the central government to allow them to create the guideline of educational curriculum. States, however, have control of basic and primary education that allow them to design their own curriculum.

Without government's access to education as whole it began to create a deepening of social and educational gaps between the elites and other classes. With little focus placed on public education, elites turned to private institutions. These acts have led to some of the most fundamental crises of education in Brazil that is the disparities between private and public institutions. One of the two most significant events for Brazilian education was in 1971 with the approval of Law 5,692. The law promised reformation to primary education, free and mandatory education for children between age of 7 and 14, and a national and unified primary level curriculum.¹¹ The second event included the National Program of Literacy and Citizenship which was an effort to reduce illiteracy in all age groups.¹² The creation of these polices set a foundation for many of the current policies on education.

Educational Disparity

APA Presidential Task Force on Educational Disparities distinguished these outcomes by initially defining disparities as unjust differences that imply the need to be readdressed. Those

¹⁰ "Brazil-History & Background." StateUniversity.com

¹¹ "Brazil - Constitutional Legal Foundations." StateUniversity.com

¹² "Brazil-History & Background." StateUniversity.com

disparities stem from three possible causes. The first being differences in socioeconomic status. The entanglement of ethnicity, social status, and economic status can cause poor quality and access to schools for minority groups. Some of those inequities can range from inability to access health care or needing to work rather than attend school in order to keep your family stable. Secondly, whether intentional or not, biased treatment of ethnic and racial minority students by teachers and peers influences achievement. Lastly, the “flexibility” of the system can result in low success rates as it provides the same equality on paper but is unable to adjust to the needs of the minority groups.¹³ Throughout this paper, each of these types of causes will exemplify the setbacks children encounter because of their skin color. Categorizing disparities will make more visible how complex educational issues are so that single actions will be insufficient in providing the best education all children deserve.

Socioeconomics in India

Considering India as a multiracial society is difficult but understanding India as light versus dark skin might make it easier to grasp how skin color, social status, and economic status blend together. Dr. Barbara R. Wilson conducted research that concluded extreme poverty, health and labor, and the parent’s limited education prevented children from succeeding in education.¹⁴ Using minority group parents in India, they demonstrated how interwoven each of these socioeconomic related issues are.

Health inequalities are experienced in every country; however, it is prominent in developing countries where healthcare has become a privilege rather than a right. Children from

¹³ Presidential Task Force on Educational Disparities, *Ethnic and racial disparities in education: Psychology’s contributions to understanding and reducing disparities*, (American Psychological Association, 2012), 1-13.

¹⁴ Barbara R. Wilson, "Education for all: Hearing Minority Parent Voice about Public Education in India," *The Qualitative Report* 20, no. 7 (2015): 1074-1075.

OBCs experience this first hand as they are defenseless against poor public health insurance coverage, lack of a well-supplied health care, and an increase in private providers. A study in Kerala demonstrated the per capita health expenditures were larger amongst upper caste due to the costly quality care available.¹⁵ Those of OBC status spend less not because they need it less but cannot afford quality care. While health inequalities are much more in depth and complex, its effect on education is strong for if a family member get sick they must either care for or make up that income.

To make up that income, the child must find work hence an increase in child labor rather than school attendance. The most recent census revealed an increase in child labor from 11.28 million in 1991 to 12.66 million in 2001.¹⁶ Types of labor vary from agricultural to industrial yet they all remain hazardous, excluded, and involve long hours of work with minimal pay. In 2001 some of these major hazardous jobs which children worked in included, 21% in pan, bidi and cigarettes, 17% in construction, 15% in domestic work, and 11% in spinning & weaving.¹⁷ Unsurprisingly child laborers thus had higher non-attendance rates at schools over children who were not involved in labor.¹⁸ Some argue that child labor actually increases the family's income but poverty actually worsens as opportunities and wages dwindle and poverty becomes passed through generations.

This leads to the last issue of extreme poverty which remains unquestionably the most problematic issue of any educational access barrier. Former untouchables are largely concentrated in rural areas as a result of their historical impurity. They heavily rely on the land to

¹⁵ Subrata Mukherjee, Slim Haddad, and Delampady Narayana, "Social class related inequalities in household health expenditure and economic burden: evidence from Kerala, south India," *International Journal of Equity in Health* 10, no.1 (2011):10.

¹⁶ Ministry of Statistics and Programme Implementation, "Children engaged in Work," *Children in India 2012*, (2012): 70.

¹⁷ Ministry of Statistics and Programme Implementation, "Children engaged in Work," 72.

¹⁸ Gordon Brown, "Child Labor & Educational Disadvantage – Breaking the Link, Building Opportunity," *UN Special Envoy for Global Education*, (2012): 9.

make a living as a 2011 report showed 54.71% of scheduled caste and 35.65% of scheduled tribes landless households depended on manual labor.¹⁹ For those who are able to obtain land, do not have it for long as retribution is administered by private sectors that belong to upper castes.

Tribal communities clear out pieces of land in jungles for cultivation before moving to a new area, these are called *podu* lands. The Forest Rights Act was passed in 2006 in attempt to redeem the effects of colonialism inflicted onto scheduled tribes. It stated that scheduled tribes have the right to forest land for livelihood.²⁰ Government programs like Haritha Haram, are prime examples of obstruction. Haritha Haram is an initiative begun by Telangana Chief Minister Sri K Chandrasekhar Rao to make Telangana a Green State. Claiming their works are for the better, they have evicted tribal communities to achieve the current 24% tree covered state to 33%. With heavy dependence on land coupled with lower castes' limited rights to the land, communities only remain poorer and unable to thrive in Indian society. In addition, this is an illustration of the weakness of laws that is a recurring theme for traditionally oppressed groups.

Socioeconomics in Brazil

While the existence of different socioeconomic groups is not surprising, what may come as a shock is the vast difference in racial inequality. Brazil is well known for a mixed population labeled as pardos, making it one of the most multi-racial societies in the world. It also makes it one of the most stratified societies where the top 10% of the population holds 46.9% of the total income according to the World Data Report of 2007.²¹ Scholars have begun to recognize that within the last few years Brazil's racial hierarchies have become more dichotomous. During the

¹⁹ Ministry of Rural Development, Government of India, "All Households (Rural)," Socio-Economic Caste Census, (2011).

²⁰ Government of India Ministry of Law and Justice, "Forest Right," *The Scheduled Tribes and Other Traditional Forest Dwellers (Recognition of Forest Rights) Act*, (2006): 3.

²¹ World Bank, "World development report: Development and the next generation." *World Bank*, (2007).

1980's the division between classes in education was apparent as pardos were receiving more education than pretos. Today, however, it is seen that both pretos and pardos are receiving the same amount of education but still less than their white counterparts.²²

In a quick glance at numbers, blacks make-up over half of the population but consist of only 20% of the GDP. In combination with their earnings being less it comes as no surprise that 78% live below the poverty line. The Institute of Applied Economic Research (IPEA) also showed how regardless of level of education, position or title, pretos are far more likely to experience downward socio-economic mobility than brancos.²³ Just as demonstrated in India, the low income levels lead to an increase in child labor.

The Brazilian Institute of Geography and Statistics (IBGE) conducted a recent survey that hinted at an increase in child labor between the ages of 5-9. The survey conducted in 2015 demonstrated 80,000 children were working and 60% of them lived in rural areas.²⁴ The International Convention 182, to which Brazil was a signatory, listed the worst forms of child labor which included slavery, drug trafficking, domestic work, and sexual exploitation. The majority of domestic work and sexual exploitation victims were black girls.

To combat poverty, *Bolsa Família* has become the most notable program in the world serving 12 million people as of 2012 through conditional cash transfers (CCT). CCT usually require some sort of fulfillment of a condition in order to receive money such as sending your daughter to school. In order to provide more for low-income families *Bolsa Família's* schooling condition required children from ages 6–15 years, but a complementary program added in 2008

²² Leticia J. Marteleto, "Educational Inequality by Race in Brazil, 1982–2007: Structural Changes and Shifts in Racial Classification," *Demography* (2012): 349-350.

²³ "Afro-Brazilians," Minority Rights Group, <http://minorityrights.org/minorities/afro-brazilians/>.

²⁴ *Debora Brito*, "Labor among children aged 5-9 increased in Brazil," Agencia Brasil. (2015).

called Benefício Variável Jovem (BVJ) expanded access to children of ages 16–17 years.²⁵ In the examination of age and gender in the study, “The impact of bolsa família on schooling,” found there were larger impacts on girls in rural areas including grade progression. Taking a step further, the program demonstrates an increase enrollment of pretos, pardos, and indigenous children. However, there is an increase in dropout rates for those students who are black as well as smaller grade promotion for these groups.²⁶ While some scholars suggest this is due to the fact that weak students are brought in from the increase enrollment rate, a deeper understanding suggests that programs within the system are insufficient in creating the necessary programs for those students. This will be further examined in section of the flexibility of Brazil, below.

Treatment in India

Teachers in India succumbed to discrimination just as much as students. Members of scheduled caste and scheduled tribes unsurprisingly suffer peer discrimination in forms of physical violence, exclusion, and verbal abuse. When someone is in a position of respect, these acts seem uncommon but S.Srinivasa Rao demonstrated how frequent it really is in his chapter “Structural Exclusion in Everyday Institutional Life: Labelling of Stigmatized Groups in an IIT.”

Vijee (name changed for study) scored 94 per cent in school, participated in numerous Mathematics Olympiads for the state of Andhra Pradesh, and received a Pratibha (Excellence) Award from the Government of Andhra Pradesh while being a scheduled tribe student. Although she fought her case which was the prevention of her entrance into IIT, Indian Institutes of

²⁵ Alan de Brauw, Daniel O. Gilligan, John Hoddinott, and Shalini Roy, “The impact of bolsa família on schooling.” *World Development* 70 (2015): 303.

²⁶ Paul Glewwe and Ana Lucia Kassouf, “The Impact Of The Bolsa Escola/Familia Conditional Cash Transfer Program On Enrollment, Drop Out Rates And Grade Promotion In Brazil,” *International Conference On Applied Economics (Icoae)*, (2010): 194.

Technology, because of her caste, all the way to the National SC/ST Commission, teachers still hindered her. One professor forced her to prove her enrollment in school even after she had provided a library identity card. An English professor consistently mentioned the sorrow she felt for her. According to the teacher, Vijee should feel grateful to have this opportunity as people from lower caste normally did not get in to higher education. Some teachers sabotaged her career by marking her absent which prevented Vijee from taking the necessary exams to pass.²⁷

If this isn't enough evidence, one of the only three Dalit teachers of 400 teachers at IIT explained that certain courses and students are allocated to specific teachers due to caste. Professors would say their SC/ST students are not capable of demanding subjects such as engineering and all together should not be in IITs. Discrimination even exists among their colleagues who believe they are superior by claiming that their Dalit colleagues would not understand or it would be beyond their comprehension of high subjects.²⁸

Discriminating is not always as direct as it appeared in Rao's study. Despite how stringent grading can be, teachers can find themselves faced with numerous issues. At times teachers can be more attentive to one exam over the next while other teachers are unsure of what the final answer should look like exactly therefore providing only partial credit. Without realization they will then turn to perceptions to place the student in the demographic rather than performance.²⁹ If lower castes are continually painted as impure or incapable their academic achievements become a further reach.

In 2012 Rema N. Hanna and Leigh L. Linden designed a study where children were to complete a test and the one who scored the highest in their group would receive prize money.

²⁷ Srinivasa S. Rao, "Structural Exclusion in Everyday Institutional Life: Labelling of Stigmatized Groups in an IIT," *Sociology of Education in India*, (2013), 211-213.

²⁸ Rao, "Structural Exclusion in Everyday Institutional Life: Labelling of Stigmatized Groups in an IIT," 214.

²⁹ Rema N. Hanna, and Leigh L. Linden, "Discrimination in Grading." *American Economic Journal: Economic Policy* 4,4 (2012): 146-68.

The 120 teachers were informed about this money to incite the importance and value grades have on the children and their futures. Even with overall straightforward exams that did not allow for subjective assessment, teachers found a way to assign upper caste students a score of .03 to .08 standard deviations higher than lower caste scores.³⁰ Thus statistical discrimination is prominent within the system even suggesting that teachers' mechanisms can be faulty and biased.

Treatment in Brazil

India was outright in its treatment of Dalits. Many individuals are aware of the treatment and do not question its extensiveness. However, in Brazil there is a pattern of widespread ignorance about racial discrimination. As previously seen with socioeconomic differences, exposure of accumulated disadvantages led to structural differences. However, this section looks further into that limited research by examining how race affects whites and nonwhites experiences with schools.

In a recent study of racial inequalities, Letícia Marteleto and Molly Dondero examined how race plays a role in the impact of education on students in Brazil. Most interestingly, they have decided to examine Brazil's inequalities through unconventional ways by examining racial disparities in the educational outcomes of twin adolescents. The study began with the recognition of racial labeling. As seen earlier, individuals are divided into different classes based on their skin color, how one is labeled can possibly determine their interaction with school. Giving the twins different racial labels demonstrated that nonwhite labels still adhere to educational disadvantages.³¹ By eliminating the factor of neighborhood and families, Marteleto and Dondero were able to boil down educational impact to race. Despite how the research is limited, which

³⁰ Hanna and Linden, "Discrimination in Grading," 159-160.

³¹ Letícia Marteleto, and Molly Dondero. "Racial Inequality in Education in Brazil: A Twins Fixed-Effects Approach," *Demography*, (2016): 1185–1205.

was stated within the study, it sets a foundation for further examination of how race affects educational advantages.

It is argued that multiracial societies do not eliminate racial inequalities nor racial biases. That can be referenced in a study that examined racial discrimination through grading in Brazil. As seen in India, biases are not always direct. Fernando Botelho, Ricardo A. Madeira and Marcos A. Rangel studied math teachers' assessments of students with respect to scholastic competence as they found biases amongst grading that is based off skills. Despite being well-behaved black students, they were more likely to be labeled incompetent thus below passing grade compared to white students.³² Teacher's inability to remain unbiased influences scores that thus influence the likelihood of succeeding in other grade levels.

Flexibility in India's Educational Programs

The last disparity mentioned by the APA Presidential Task Force on Educational Disparities completely dismantles India's educational system. India's efforts to create more access to education do not prevent the high rates of student dropouts of lower caste members in comparison to the upper caste. Poverty goes beyond being able to afford school, but also includes the quality of schools. The RTE Act states that it will provide more schools in local areas, transportation, and free education, however, deeper examinations demonstrate these efforts are not qualitative. Today in India there are three different types of schools: government-run schools, government schools run by voluntary organizations, and private schools all of which have in common caste discrimination.³³

³² Fernando Botelho, Ricardo A. Madeira, and Marcos A. Rangel, "Racial Discrimination in Grading: Evidence from Brazil," *American Economic Journal: Applied Economics*, (2015): 49.

³³ Hickey and Stratton, "Schooling in India: Effects of Gender and Caste," 69.

Within government-financed schools, the quality is so poor on all levels ranging from physical components to effective teaching skills, that attendance in private schools continually increases at a rapid pace. Kerala experienced an increase in admission of 54.2% of children in private schools. Similarly, Tamil Nadu saw attendance grow from 19.7% to 25.1% in 2009.³⁴ Earlier it was stated how intertwined poverty and Dalits are, which is why many of the lower caste do not contribute to these increasing attendance rates in private schools.

Poor quality of education begins with teachers. As previously mentioned, teachers do not treat Dalit students at the same level as those belonging to a higher caste. However, it is not just treatment but the lack of flexibility from teachers who thus fail to productively teach students from poverty that now struggle to compete with India's demanding job market. India's law required primary schools to be one kilometer away from every village, quickly, sixty students would fill up a school with three teachers that did not all frequently show up.³⁵ Their low attendance is due to two factors, an overload and commitment.

According to RTE Act there should be one teacher for every thirty students in primary school and in upper primary, thirty-five students to one teacher. However, this is not the case in majority of Indian schools. On average class size rose to forty students per teacher but could sometimes increase to sixty or seventy with some extreme cases in the hundreds.³⁶ Government funded schools overwhelmed teachers by having a lack of sufficient teachers to apply for positions. Parents thus turn to private schools in hopes teachers will have more focus on their child with a limited number of students.

³⁴ Reena Cheruvalath, "Is the right of children to free and compulsory education act really beneficial to the poorer children in India? An analysis with special reference to the admission of poorer children in public unaided schools," *Education 3-13* 43,6 (2015): 624.

³⁵ Cheruvalath, "Is the right of children to free and compulsory education act really beneficial to the poorer children in India? An analysis with special reference to the admission of poorer children in public unaided schools," 623.

³⁶ Cheruvalath, "Is the right of children to free and compulsory education act really beneficial to the poorer children in India? An analysis with special reference to the admission of poorer children in public unaided schools," 623.

Secondly, either teacher's focus become redirected or they develop less motivation therefore commitment to programs dwindle. Lack of motivation can be attributed to the law that authorizes every student to be moved into the next grade every year.³⁷ Teachers either do not stress lesson plans enough or do not follow the level majority students are at. New Delhi sixth graders in poor areas demonstrated math comprehension two levels below requirement.³⁸ Students are unable to keep up creating an unstable foundation in their education that disables their ability to compete against those who have better quality education.

Flexibility in Brazil's Educational Programs

PISA, Programme for International Student Assessment, evaluates education systems around the world by testing the skills and knowledge of 15-year-old students. In the sections of reading, science, and mathematics, Brazil falls largely below average.³⁹ Breaking it down racially, half of all blacks/pretos are illiterate, compared to their white peers of whom less than 20% are unable to read. Additionally 40% of blacks are completing less than seven years of schooling.⁴⁰ Researchers found that an explanation can be that a parent's level of education can impact schooling. For instance, a student whose parent received a higher level of an education led to a perceived quality of education for that student. A parent who received an education lower than high school led to a lower income and thus sent their child to a public school. As discussed in the socioeconomics in Brazil, 78% of blacks are below poverty line thus they are more likely to send their children to public schools rather than private.

³⁷ "Why the world's biggest school system is failing its pupils," *The Economist*, (2017).

³⁸ "Why the world's biggest school system is failing its pupils." *The Economist*, (2017).

³⁹ OECD, "Brazil," *Compare Your Country - PISA*, (2015).

⁴⁰ "Afro-Brazilians," Minority Rights Group.

The funds are largely limited in public schools. Estimated direct public investment in education per student ranges from R\$2 to R\$3 for primary and secondary education. Meanwhile almost R\$15 per student is spent on university level. A state will pay for a student three times less than the same student who would attend a private school for one year.⁴¹ Thus what has occurred is a finance game between the public and private sectors of education. For instance religious institutions or charities seek to gain the status of public institutions in order to access public funds. The status of public and non-state institutions with a non-profit character allows encouragement to large companies to invest in education whose own goal is profit. Student education becomes a commodity that allows companies to succeed.

In theory, the more money the better, right? The limited funding of public primary and secondary schools has actually led those with a disadvantaged background such as pretos and pardos to be less likely to pass the vestibular exams to public university. Brazilian teachers in a study reported that they spend more time on administrative tasks and keeping order in the classroom which has allowed for less time teaching. That can also from the fact that only 64.6% of all teachers are properly certified to provide good-quality teaching despite Brazilian law.⁴² That thus questions the quality of teachers which can overall make or break an educational system.

In a study of teacher quality and student achievement in Brazil, it was concluded that a teacher's ability was vital in a student's achievement. For instance, the teachers who had a second job, due to low salaries for teachers, had students who were less likely to succeed and

⁴¹ Abdeljalil Akkari, "Blurring The Boundaries Of Public And Private Education In Brazil," *Journal of International Education and Leadership*, 3 (2013): 5.

⁴² Thiago Alves and José Marcelino De Rezende Pinto, "Teachers' Salaries And Labour Conditions In Brazil: A Contribution From Censuses Data," (2011): 8.

teachers with higher incomes produced higher achieving students.⁴³ In combination with the PISA 2015 report and the understanding of the money driven goals of schools, it is clear that lack of financial support has led to significant impacts on students' achievements and quality of school.

Conclusion

It is extremely critical and imperative to note that these disparities are just a part of the education systems within India and Brazil. Each section provides small glimpses and urges deeper research into how these different disparities are connected to traditionally oppressed group's struggle. Brazil's education system requires more than just affirmative action on one dimension which includes more than just gender and/or on different levels of education. One such action should include a need to increase support to public schools in order to create quality education for all groups. India similarly needs to call upon society to equate the playing field for all students. It is clear in this stratified society, foundational changes are needed to occur in order to create more successful educational systems for various groups such as the Dalits.

In truth, it is a call all countries need to answer. Educational systems around the world all can be doing better and should constantly be improving their educational systems for all people as it is vital to individual and national development. It would be naive to assume there is a region that has overcome the listed disparities in this paper. However, this does not mean it is impossible. Institutional as well as cultural foundations need to constantly examine disparities specific to that area and then analyze them to determine core problems. In order to achieve this though there needs to be a greater push from societies to create efficient educational environments for all people.

⁴³ Larissa da Silva Marioni, Ricardo da Silva Freguglia, and Menezes Filho, "Teacher quality and student achievement: Evidence from Brazilian longitudinal data," (2014): 9.

Work Cited

- "Afro-Brazilians." *Minority Rights Group*. <http://minorityrights.org/minorities/afro-brazilians/>.
- Akkari, Abdeljalil. "Blurring The Boundaries Of Public And Private Education In Brazil." *Journal of International Education and Leadership*. 3,1 (2013): 1-13.
- Alves, Thiago, and José Marcelino De Rezende Pinto. "Teachers' Salaries And Labour Conditions In Brazil: A Contribution From Censuses Data." (2011): 1-28.
- Bacelar Da Silva, Antonio José, "Dialogism as Antiracist Education: Engaging with Competing Racial Ideologies in Brazil." *Anthropology & Education Quarterly* 45, 4 (2014): 319-336.
- Bloom, Adi. "Teaching the untouchables." *TES: Times Educational Supplement* (2013): 26-30.
- Brauwer, Alan de, Daniel O. Gilligan, John Hoddinott, and Shalini Roy. "The impact of bolsa família on schooling." *World Development* 70 (2015): 303-316.
- Brito, Debohara "Labor among children aged 5-9 increased in Brazil," *Agencia Brasil*. (2015).
- Botelho, Fernando, Ricardo A. Madeira, and Marcos A. Rangel. "Racial Discrimination in Grading: Evidence from Brazil." *American Economic Journal: Applied Economics* 7, no. 4 (2015): 37-52.
- Bourdieu, Pierre. "The forms of capital." *Handbook of Theory and Research for the Sociology of Education*. ed. J. Richardson (1986): 46-58.

Brown, Gordon. "Child Labor & Educational Disadvantage – Breaking the Link, Building Opportunity." *UN Special Envoy for Global Education* (2012): 1-78.

Castleman, Bruce A. "Social Climbers in a Colonial Mexican City: Individual Mobility within the Sistema de Castas in Orizaba, 1777-1791." *Colonial Latin American Review* 10, 2 (2001): 229-249.

Chauhan, Chandra Pal Singh. "Education and caste in India." *Asia Pacific Journal of Education* 28, 3 (2008): 217-234.

Cherualath, Reena. "Is the right of children to free and compulsory education act really beneficial to the poorer children in India? An analysis with special reference to the admission of poorer children in public unaided schools." *Education 3-13* 43,6 (2015): 621-629.

da Silva Marioni, Larissa, Ricardo da Silva Freguglia, and Menezes Filho. "Teacher quality and student achievement: Evidence from Brazilian longitudinal data." (2014): 1-39.

Glewwe, Paul, and Ana Lucia Kassouf. "The Impact Of The Bolsa Escola/Familia Conditional Cash Transfer Program On Enrollment, Drop Out Rates And Grade Promotion In Brazil." *International Conference On Applied Economics (Icoae)*. (2010): 189-199.

Government of India Ministry of Law and Justice. "Forest Right." *The Scheduled Tribes and Other Traditional Forest Dwellers (Recognition of Forest Rights) Act*. (2006): 3-5.

Hanna, Rema N., and Leigh L. Linden. "Discrimination in Grading." *American Economic Journal: Economic Policy* 4, 4 (2012): 146-168.

Hickey, M. Gail and Mary Stratton. "Schooling in India: Effects of Gender and Caste." *scholarlypartnershipsedu* 2,1 (2007): 59-85.

Marteleteo, Leticia J. "Educational Inequality by Race in Brazil, 1982–2007: Structural Changes and Shifts in Racial Classification." *Demography* 49, 1 (2012): 337-58.

Marteleteo, Leticia, and Molly Dondero. "Racial Inequality in Education in Brazil: A Twins Fixed-Effects Approach." *Demography* 53,4 (2016): 1185–1205.

Ministry of Statistics and Programme Implementation. "Children engaged in Work." *Children in India 2012*. (2012): 70-76.

Ministry of Rural Development, Government of India. "All Households (Rural)." Socio-Economic Caste Census. (2011).

Mukherjee, Subrata, Slim Haddad, and Delampady Narayana. "Social class related inequalities in household health expenditure and economic burden: evidence from Kerala, south India." *International Journal of Equity in Health* 10, 1 (2011): 1-13.

OECD. "Brazil." *Compare Your Country - PISA*. (2015).

Presidential Task Force on Educational Disparities. "Ethnic and racial disparities in education: Psychology's contributions to understanding and reducing disparities." *American Psychological Association*. (2012): 1-121.

Rao, Srinivasa S. "Structural Exclusion in Everyday Institutional Life: Labelling of Stigmatized Groups in an IIT." *Sociology of Education in India* (2013): 199-223.

"Right to Education." *Ministry of Human Resource Development, Government of India*. (2016).

"Tribals deprived of their legal rights over forest lands: CPI." *The Hindu*. (2017).

"Why the world's biggest school system is failing its pupils." *The Economist*. (2017).
<https://www.economist.com/news/asia/21723137-more-indians-are-attending-school-ever-they-are-not-learning-much-why-worlds>.

Wilson, Barbara R. "Education for all: Hearing Minority Parent Voice about Public Education in India." *The Qualitative Report* 20, 7 (2015): 1062-1082.

World Bank. "World development report: Development and the next generation." *World Bank* (2007).

Xavier, Ângela Barreto. "Languages of Difference in the Portuguese Empire. the Spread of "Caste" in the Indian World */Lenguajes De Diferencia En El Imperio Portugués. La Difusión De "Casta" En La India/Linguagens De Diferença no Império Português. A Difusão De "Casta" Na Índia." *Anuario Colombiano De Historia Social y De La Cultura* 43,2 (2016): 89-119.